



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

August 23, 2007

Ms. Judith A. Hargrove  
Attorney at Law  
Hargrove & Evans, L.L.P.  
4425 Mopac South, Building 3, Suite 400  
Austin, Texas 78735

OR2007-11012

Dear Ms. Hargrove:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 287505.

The Anderson County Appraisal District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for "all data contained in your commercial and residential sales databases" and "any sales data you have with confirmed prices from sales of commercial and/or residential property since 01/01/2005." You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.148 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> You also indicate that the submitted information may be subject to third party proprietary interests. Pursuant to section 552.305 of the Government Code, you have notified the Palestine Board of Realtors of the request and of its right to submit arguments to this office as to why the information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining that statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of

---

<sup>1</sup>We note that the district failed to raise section 552.148 within the ten business day deadline mandated in section 552.301(b). *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). However, because section 552.148 is a mandatory exception that can provide a compelling reason to withhold information, we will consider your arguments under this exception. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302).

exception to disclosure under the Act in certain circumstances). We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>2</sup>

The provision to be codified as Section 552.148 of the Government Code provides in relevant part, “[i]nformation relating to real property sales prices, descriptions, characteristics, and other related information received from a private entity by the comptroller or the chief appraiser of an appraisal district under Chapter 6, Tax Code, is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021.” Act of May 21, 2007, 80th Leg., R.S., ch. 471 § 1, 2007 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 471 (Vernon) (to be codified at Gov’t Code § 552.148). You state that the submitted information consists of real property sales information obtained from Multiple Listing Services. You do not inform us that the district is authorized to release this information to the requestor. *See id.* (Gov’t Code § 552.148(b)). Based on your representations and our review of the information at issue, we find that the district must withhold the submitted information under the provision to be codified as section 552.148 of the Government Code.<sup>3</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the

---

<sup>2</sup>We assume that the “representative sample” of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

<sup>3</sup>As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure.

Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Heather Pendleton Ross  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

HPR/mcf

Ref: ID# 287505

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Ms. Jeri Mustain  
O'Connor & Associates  
2200 North Loop West, Suite 200  
Houston, Texas 77018  
(w/o enclosures)

Palestine Board of Realtors  
P.O. Box 2246  
Austin, Texas 78768  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Carson Wages  
Officer of Public Information  
Anderson County Appraisal District  
P.O. Box 279  
Palestine, Texas 75802  
(w/o enclosures)