



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

August 29, 2007

Ms. Judith Sachitano Rawls  
Assistant City Attorney  
Beaumont Police Department  
P.O. Box 3827  
Beaumont, Texas 77704-3827

OR2007-11224

Dear Ms. Rawls:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 288450.

The Beaumont Police Department (the "department") received a request for any and all records and reports regarding a specified individual. You state that you will provide some of the requested information to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, the governmental body must meet both prongs of this test. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U. S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764

(1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. We note, however, that because the common-law right to privacy is a personal right that lapses at death, the department may not withhold any compiled criminal history information that relates to the deceased individual based upon common-law privacy. *See Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides in pertinent part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

*Id.* § 58.007(c). The incident report that you have marked in Exhibit C consists of law enforcement records of a juvenile engaged in delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03(a) (defining "delinquent conduct" for purposes of section 58.007). It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply. Therefore, the marked incident report in Exhibit C is confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Next, you claim that the remaining information in Exhibits B and C is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108 provides in pertinent part as follows:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

(1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime; [or]

(2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

...

(c) This section does not except from the requirements of Section 552.021 information that is basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1)-(2), (c). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication.

You inform us that Exhibit B relates to a pending criminal homicide prosecution. You assert that release of this report would interfere with the detection, investigation, and prosecution of crime. Based upon your representations, we find that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to this report. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (per curiam) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). You also inform us that the remaining incident reports in Exhibit C pertain to criminal investigations that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Therefore, these reports are subject to section 552.108(a)(2).

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*, including a detailed description of the offense. Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold Exhibit B pursuant to section 552.108(a)(1), and the remaining incident reports in Exhibit C pursuant to section 552.108(a)(2).

In summary, the department must withhold the incident report you have marked in Exhibit C under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code in conjunction with section 552.101 of the

Government Code. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold Exhibit B pursuant to section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code, and the remaining incident reports in Exhibit C pursuant to section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

---

<sup>1</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "A. Meesey", with a large, sweeping flourish at the end.

Allan D. Meesey  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

ADM/eeg

Ref: ID# 288450

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Langston Scott Adams  
Law Offices of Langston Scott Adams  
3708 Gulfway Drive, Suite B  
Port Arthur, Texas 77642  
(w/o enclosures)