



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 31, 2007

Ms. Pamela Smith
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Public Safety
5805 North Lamar Boulevard, Box 4087
Austin, Texas 78773-0001

OR2007-11405

Dear Ms. Smith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 288046.

The Texas Department of Public Safety (the "department") received three requests for information that sought (1) expense reports and travel vouchers for the Governor's security detail on the March trip to the Middle East; (2) travel vouchers for any out of state trip from January to December 2001 and January to June 2007; and (3) annual security detail costs for the Governor from 1979 to the present date, as well as copies of travel vouchers for the Governor's security detail. The department states that it will release some aggregated expense information to the requestors. You claim that the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, the department states that some aspects of these requests require it to do general research. We note that the Act does not require a governmental body to answer factual questions, conduct legal research, or create new information in responding to a request. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 563 at 8 (1990), 555 at 1-2 (1990). However, the Act does require that a governmental body make a good faith effort to relate a request to information

¹You indicate that the information submitted in response to the first request constitutes a representative sample of responsive information for the second and third requests. We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

that it holds. *See* Open Records Decision No. 561 (1990) (construing statutory predecessor). We assume that you have made such an effort.

We next note that the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(3) provides for the required public disclosure of “information in an account, voucher, or contract relating to the receipt or expenditure of public or other funds by a governmental body,” unless the information is expressly confidential under other law. Gov’t Code § 552.022(a)(3). Because section 552.101 of the Government Code constitutes other law for purposes of section 552.022, we will address the applicability of this exception to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common law privacy. Common law privacy protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). This office has found that information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy upon a showing of “special circumstances.” *See* Open Records Decision No. 169 (1977). This office considers “special circumstances” to refer to a very narrow set of situations in which the release of information would likely cause someone to face “an imminent threat of physical danger.” *Id.* at 6. Such “special circumstances” do not include “a generalized and speculative fear of harassment or retribution.” *Id.*

The department asserts that all of the submitted information must be withheld because the privacy rights of the Governor include the right to be safe from physical harm. You state that the department is responsible for the Governor’s personal safety, as well as the personal safety of his family. You explain that the submitted information reveals the number of individuals protecting the Governor and that the department does not publicly identify the number of individuals protecting the Governor on a permanent basis or at any particular time. You state that the release of this information would be valuable for someone who intended to cause the Governor harm. Based on your representations and our review, we determine that the release of the submitted information would place the Governor in imminent threat of physical danger. Accordingly, the department must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the “special circumstances” aspect of common law privacy.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by

filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Kara A. Batey". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, stylized "D" at the end.

Kara A. Batey
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KAB/jh

Ref: ID# 288046

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. W. Gardner Selby
Austin American-Statesman
305 South Congress
Austin, Texas 78704
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Peggy Fikac
S. A. Express-News/ Houston Chronicle
1005 Congress, Suite 1060
Austin, Texas 78701
(w/o enclosures)