



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 9, 2007

Mr. Daniel Bradford
Assistant County Attorney
Travis County
P.O. Box 1748
Austin, Texas 78767

OR2007-13099

Dear Mr. Bradford:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 291461.

The Travis County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney") received a request for six categories of information related to a specified case. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we address the portion of the request seeking "all physical, tangible objects that were confiscated[.]" The Act applies to "public information," which is defined as information that is collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business by a governmental body or for a governmental body, and the governmental body owns the information or has a right of access to it. Gov't Code § 552.002. This office has ruled that tangible physical items are not "information" as that term is contemplated under the Act. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990). Thus, any responsive tangible physical evidence that is maintained by the district attorney is not public information, and the district attorney is not required to release such tangible evidence to the requestor in response to the present request. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.002, .021.

Next, we note that the submitted information contains documents filed with a court, which are expressly public under section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. Such information must be released unless it is expressly confidential under other law. You claim that the information at issue is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, section 552.108 is a discretionary exception that protects a governmental body's interests and is therefore not "other law" for purposes of section 552.022(a)(17). *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 586 (1991) (governmental body may waive section 552.108). Therefore, the district attorney may not withhold any of the court-filed documents under section 552.108. Accordingly, the court-filed documents, which we have marked, must be released to the requestor.

We next address your arguments against disclosure of the remaining information. Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides, in pertinent part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

(4) it is information that:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) represents the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(4). A governmental body must reasonably explain how and why section 552.108 is applicable to the information that the governmental body seeks to withhold under this exception. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977); Open Records Decision No. 434 at 2-3 (1986). In *Curry v. Walker*, 873 S.W.2d 379 (Tex. 1994), the Texas Supreme Court held that a request for a district attorney's "entire litigation file" was "too broad" and, quoting *National Union Fire Insurance Co. v. Valdez*, 863 S.W.2d 458 (Tex. 1993, orig. proceeding), held that "the decision as to what to include in [the file] necessarily reveals the attorney's thought processes concerning the prosecution or defense of the case." *Curry*, 873 S.W.2d at 380.

You explain that the present request encompasses the district attorney's entire criminal litigation file. You further assert that release of the requested information would reveal the mental impressions or legal reasoning of the district attorney. Based on your representations and our review of the information in question, we find that section 552.108(a)(4) is applicable in this instance.

We note, however, that section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). See Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information made public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, which must be released, and the marked court-filed documents, which are expressly public under section 552.022(a)(17), the district attorney may withhold the submitted information from disclosure based on section 552.108(a)(4) and the court's holding in *Curry*.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be

sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Jordan Johnson".

Jordan Johnson
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JJ/jb

Ref: ID# 291461

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Carmen Menchaca
4534 Alvarado Lane
Laredo, Texas 78046
(w/o enclosures)