



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

November 19, 2007

Mr. Ron G. MacFarlane, Jr.  
Dealey, Zimmermann, Clark, Malouf & MacFarlane, P.C.  
For the City of Cedar Hill  
3131 Turtle Creek Boulevard, Suite 1201  
Dallas, Texas 75219-5415

OR2007-15203

Dear Mr. MacFarlane:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 294936.

The City of Cedar Hill (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for Cedar Hill Fire Department e-mails sent from Station 3 to Fire Chief Steve Pollock and the personnel file of a former employee. You state that the e-mails at issue have been released to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.117, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

You assert that some of the submitted information is excepted under section 552.101 of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, including federal law. Section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code provides that tax return information is confidential. *See* 26 U.S.C. § 6103(a)(2), (b)(2)(A), (p)(8); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992); Attorney General Op. MW-372 (1981). Accordingly, the W-4 tax form you have marked in the

---

<sup>1</sup>Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

submitted information is confidential under section 6103(a), and the city must withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup>

Section 552.101 also encompasses the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides the following:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b),(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Medical records must be released upon the patient's signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *See* Occ. Code §§ 159.004, .005. Any subsequent release of medical records must be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. *See id.* § 159.002(c); Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The medical record that we have marked may only be released by the city in accordance with the MPA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991).

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential under section 552.024. Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117 must be determined at the time the request for it is received. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Therefore, the city may only withhold information under section 552.117 on behalf of current or former officials or employees who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for this information was received. You state, and provide supporting documentation showing, that the former employee at issue elected to keep his personal information confidential before the city received the request for information; therefore, the city must withhold most of the information that you have marked in Exhibit B pursuant to

---

<sup>2</sup>As we are able to resolve this under section 552.101, we do not address your other argument for exception of this information.

section 552.117, except as we have marked for release. You must also withhold the information that we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) Government Code.

You assert that some of the remaining information is excepted under section 552.130 of the Government Code, which provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). We agree that the city must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130.

In summary, the city must withhold the marked W-4 tax form under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law. The medical record that we have marked may only be released by the city in accordance with the MPA. The city must withhold the personal information that you have marked and the information that we have marked in Exhibit B under section 552.117(a)(1), except as we have marked for release. The city must withhold the motor vehicle information that you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Henisha D. Anderson". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a large initial "H" and "A".

Henisha D. Anderson  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

HDA/jb

Ref: ID# 294936

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Damion Wyatt  
151 North Waterford Oaks  
Cedar Hill, Texas 75104  
(w/o enclosures)