



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

December 6, 2007

Ms. M. Ann Montgomery  
Assistant Ellis County & District Attorney  
1201 North Highway 77, Suite 104  
Waxahachie, Texas 75165-7832

OR2007-16043

Dear Ms. Montgomery:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 296962.

The Ellis County Sheriff's Department (the "sheriff") received a request for all incident reports from a particular time period involving a specified address and six named individuals. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that a portion of the submitted information, which we have marked, is not responsive to the instant request for information because it does not involve the specified address and any of the named individuals. The sheriff need not release non-responsive information in response to this request and this ruling will not address that information. See *Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed).

We address your arguments for the responsive information. Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus.*

*Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U. S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. The present request requires the sheriff to compile unspecified police records concerning the individuals at issue. Therefore, the sheriff must withhold unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You claim that the information at issue is subject to chapter 411 of the Government Code. Section 552.101 encompasses chapter 411, which makes confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center ("NCIC") or by the Texas Crime Information Center ("TCIC"). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See id.* Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Upon review, we determine that no portion of the information at issue constitutes CHRI generated by TCIC and NCIC. Therefore, no portion of the information is confidential under chapter 411 and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

You also claim that the information at issue is excepted under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. *Id.* § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. You state that the information at issue relates to closed investigations that did not result in charges being filed. Based on this representation, we conclude that section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the information we have marked.

We note that section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976), and includes a detailed description of the offense. With the exception of basic information, the sheriff may withhold the information we have marked under section 552.108(a)(2).

In summary, the sheriff must withhold law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the sheriff may withhold the information we have marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be

sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Jordan Johnson". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Jordan Johnson  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JJ/jb

Ref: ID# 296962

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Rebecca M. Gentry  
622 Cardinal  
Ovilla, Texas 75154  
(w/o enclosures)