



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 20, 2007

Mr. Mark G. Mann
Assistant City Attorney
City of Garland
P.O. Box 469002
Garland, Texas 75046-9002

OR2007-16890

Dear Mr. Mann:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 297954.

The Garland Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to "manufacturing of methamphetamine and the seizures of any methamphetamine labs" for a specified period of time. You state that the department does not have some of the requested information.¹ You also state that some of the requested information has been released, but claim that some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 261.201(a) of the Family Code provides as follows:

¹The Act does not require a governmental body to disclose information that did not exist when the request for information was received. *Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex.App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision No. 452 at 3 (1986).

The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Offense Report 2005R016495 consists of files, reports, records, communications, or working papers used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261; therefore, this information is within the scope of section 261.201. You do not indicate that the department has adopted a rule governing the release of this type of information; therefore, we assume that no such regulation exists. Based on this assumption, we conclude that Offense Report 2005R016495 is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code, and the department must withhold it in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. We agree that the department must withhold the information you have marked in blue under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You assert that the remaining information marked in red is excepted under section 552.108 of the Government Code, which provides in relevant part the following:

- (a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:
 - (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime;

....

(b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

(1) release of the internal record or notation would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1). A governmental body claiming subsection 552.108(a)(1) or 552.108(b)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

You state that the remaining information marked in red relates to pending criminal investigations. Based on your representations and our review, we conclude that release of the this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases).

Section 552.108(b)(1) protects information the public disclosure of which would interfere with law enforcement and crime prevention. *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320, 327 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.) (section 552.108(b)(1) protects information that, if released, would permit private citizens to anticipate weaknesses in police department, avoid detection, jeopardize officer safety, and generally undermine police efforts to effectuate state laws); Open Records Decision Nos. 562 at 10 (1990), 531 at 2 (1989). You state that the submitted information contains the identifying information of undercover police officers and that the release of their identifying information would interfere with law enforcement and jeopardize the officers' safety. We note, however, that basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.108. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic arrest information includes a detailed description of the offense, names of the investigating officers, the place of arrest, the location of the crime, and premises involved. *Houston Chronicle*, 531 S.W.2d at 185-87; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 4 (1976). Although you assert that the identifying information of the undercover officers in the reports at issue are excepted under section 552.108(b)(1), these officers were investigating officers in the reports, and thus this information is basic information that may not be withheld on that basis. However, in Open Records Decision No. 169 (1977), this office recognized that information that would ordinarily be subject to disclosure may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy on a showing of "special circumstances." This office considers such "special circumstances" to refer to a very narrow set of situations in which release of the information at issue would likely cause someone to face "an imminent threat of physical

danger.” ORD 169 at 6. “Special circumstances” do not include “a generalized and speculative fear of harassment or retribution.” *Id.* Having considered your arguments and the submitted information, we find that the department must withhold the basic information that identifies undercover police officers, which you have marked in purple, pursuant to section 552.101 on the basis of common-law privacy and special circumstances. The department may withhold the remaining information marked in red pursuant to section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

You assert that some of the remaining information is excepted under section 552.130 of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure information that “relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state.” *Id.* § 552.130. We agree that the department must withhold the additional Texas motor vehicle record information marked in green pursuant to section 552.130.

To conclude, the department must withhold the following information pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code: Offense Report 2005R016495 under section 261.201 of the Family Code; the information marked in blue under common-law privacy; and the information marked in purple under common-law privacy and special circumstances. The department must also withhold the information marked in green under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the remaining information marked in red under section 552.108 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information. As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address your remaining arguments to withhold the information at issue.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body

will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,


James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/jh

Ref: ID# 297954

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Stuart Boslow
CBS11
10111 North Central Expressway
Dallas, Texas 75231
(w/o enclosures)