



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

January 2, 2008

Ms. Patricia Fleming  
Assistant General Counsel  
Texas Department of Criminal Justice  
Office of the General Counsel  
P.O. Box 4004  
Huntsville, Texas 77342-4004

OR2008-00027

Dear Ms. Fleming:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 298563.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for eleven categories of information pertaining to a named former inmate and department policies. You state that you have released some of the requested information. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.134 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.<sup>1</sup> We have also considered comments submitted by the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under the Act regarding the submitted information. Pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body receiving an open records

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume that the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

request for information that it wishes to withhold pursuant to one of the exceptions to public disclosure is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving the request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e). You state that the department received the request on October 9, 2007. Accordingly, you were required to submit the written comments and requested information to us by October 30, 2007. However, you did not submit the information required under section 552.301(e) until October 31, 2007. Consequently, we find that the department failed to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301(e) results in the legal presumption that the submitted information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). A compelling reason exists when third-party interests are at stake or when information is confidential under other law. Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977). Section 552.108 is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Open Record Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (discretionary exceptions generally), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). In failing to comply with section 552.301, the department has waived its claims under section 552.108. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, as sections 552.101 and 552.134 can provide compelling reasons to withhold the submitted information, we will consider your arguments under these exceptions.

Next, we note that one of the documents at issue is a medical record, access to which is governed by the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part the following:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the

information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b), (c). Medical records must be released upon the patient's signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *Id.* §§ 159.004, 159.005. Section 159.002(c) also requires that any subsequent release of medical records be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). Medical records may be released only as provided under the MPA. Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). We have marked the portion of the submitted information that constitutes a medical record and that may only be released in accordance with the MPA.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Section 290dd-2 of title 42 of the United States Code provides in part:

(a) Requirement. Records of the identity, diagnosis, prognosis, or treatment of any patient which are maintained in connection with the performance of any program or activity relating to substance abuse education, prevention, training, treatment, rehabilitation, or research, which is conducted, regulated, or directly or indirectly assisted by any department or agency of the United States shall, except as provided in subsection (e) of this section, be confidential and be disclosed only for the purposes and under the circumstances expressly authorized under subsection (b) of this section.

42 U.S.C. § 290dd-2(a); *see* 42 C.F.R. § 2.1 (records of identity, diagnosis, prognosis, or treatment of any patient which are maintained in connection with performance of drug abuse prevention function conducted, regulated, or directly or indirectly assisted by any department or agency of United States are generally confidential). We understand that the department operates a federally funded substance abuse treatment program. We note that federal law allows for the release of a patient's substance abuse records upon proper written consent. 42 C.F.R. §§ 2.15, .31, .33; *see* 42 U.S.C. § 290dd-2(b)(1). Accordingly, the substance abuse record that we have marked may be released only as provided under section 290dd-2 of title 42 of the United States Code and sections 2.15, 2.31, and 2.33 of title 42 of the Code of Federal Regulations. However, we find that the department has failed to demonstrate that the remaining information at issue consists of substance abuse records. Therefore, the remaining information may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 508.313 of the Government Code, which provides in part:

(a) All information obtained and maintained [by the Texas Department of Criminal Justice], including a victim protest letter or other correspondence, a victim impact statement, a list of inmates eligible for release on parole, and an arrest record of an inmate, is confidential and privileged if the information relates to:

(1) an inmate of the institutional division [of the Texas Department of Criminal Justice] subject to release on parole, release to mandatory supervision, or executive clemency;

(2) a releasee; or

(3) a person directly identified in any proposed plan of release for an inmate.

Gov't Code § 508.313(a); *see also id.* § 508.001(9) (“releasee” means a person released on parole or to mandatory supervision). You state that some of the remaining information relates to an inmate subject to release on parole or a person who was released on parole. You state that the requestor does not represent an eligible entity that is authorized to obtain the information at issue under section 508.313(c). *See id.* § 508.313(c)-(d). You also state that none of the information is subject to chapter 62 of the Code of Criminal Procedure or section 552.029 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 508.313(e)-(f).<sup>2</sup> Based on your representations and our review, we conclude that the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 508.313 of the Government Code.

Section 552.134 of the Government Code relates to information about inmates of the department and provides in relevant part:

(a) Except as provided by Subsection (b) or by Section 552.029, information obtained or maintained by the Texas Department of Criminal Justice is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if it is information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the department.

Gov't Code § 552.134(a). A portion of the submitted information consists of information about the requestor's client, a former inmate who was confined in a facility operated by the department. We find that none of the exceptions in section 552.029 are applicable. Although section 552.023 of the Government Code gives a person a “special right of access,

---

<sup>2</sup>Section 508.313(e) provides that section 508.313 does not apply to information relating to a sex offender that is authorized for release under chapter 62 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Section 508.313(f) provides that section 508.313 does not apply to information that is subject to required public disclosure under section 552.029 of the Government Code.

beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests," we note that section 552.134 does not protect only the inmate's privacy interest. *See id.* § 552.023. Therefore, section 552.023 does not provide the requestor a special right of access to the information at issue. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.134 of the Government Code.

In summary, the marked medical record may only be released in accordance with the MPA. The substance abuse information, which we have marked, may be released only as provided under section 290dd-2 of title 42 of the United States Code and sections 2.15, 2.31, and 2.33 of title 42 of the Code of Federal Regulations. The department must withhold the parolee information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 508.313 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked pursuant to section 552.134 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released.<sup>3</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline,

---

<sup>3</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure.

toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Jonathan Miles  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JM/jh

Ref: ID# 298563

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Debora Dorman  
Bellinger & DeWolf, L.L.P.  
10000 North Central Expressway, Suite 900  
Dallas, Texas 75231  
(w/o enclosures)