



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 4, 2008

Mr. John C. West
General Counsel
Office of Inspector General
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P.O. Box 13084
Austin, Texas 78711

Mr. James M. Frazier, III
Assistant General Counsel
Office of General Counsel
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P.O. Box 4004
Huntsville, Texas 77342-4004

OR2008-00114

Dear Mr. West & Mr. Frazier:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 301026.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for the personnel files of all department employees who "have gone to work for the Texas Youth Commission." The requestor subsequently modified the request to encompass only the records of six named employees. The department's Office of the General Counsel (the "OGC") and its Office of the Inspector General (the "OIG") have submitted separate requests for a decision from this office. The OGC states that it has released the requested information pertaining to one of the specified employees in reliance upon Open Records Letter No. 2007-13786 (2007), but seeks to withhold some of the information pertaining to the other five employees under section 552.101 of the Government Code. The OIG states that it will release information pertaining to two of its employees, but is withholding information subject to section 552.117 pursuant to the previous determination it received in

Open Records Letter No. 2005-01067 (2005).¹ The OIG also states that it is withholding social security numbers under section 552.147 of the Government Code.² The OIG claims that the remaining responsive information it has submitted is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.107, 552.115, 552.130, 552.134, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information, some of which consists of representative samples.³

We first note that the information submitted by the OIG was the subject of a previous request for information, as a result of which this office issued Open Records Letter No. 2007-16351 (2007). The OIG does not indicate that there has been any change in the law, facts, and circumstances on which the previous ruling is based. Therefore, the department must dispose of the information submitted by the OIG in accordance with the previous ruling.⁴ *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 at 6-7 (2001) (listing elements of first type of previous determination under Gov't Code § 552.301(a)).

We now address the OGC's arguments for the information it submitted. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses federal statutes. The remaining information contains Employment Eligibility Verification ("I-9") forms, which are governed by section 1324a of Title 8 of the United States Code. This section provides that an I-9 form and "any information contained in or appended to such form, may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter" and for enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. *See* 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); *see also* 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). Release of the I-9 forms in this instance would be "for purposes other than for enforcement" of the referenced federal statutes. Accordingly, we conclude that the I-9 forms are confidential and may only be released in compliance with the federal laws and regulations governing the employment verification system.

¹Open Records Letter No. 2005-01067 (2005) serves as a previous determination that the present and former home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former employees of the department, regardless of whether the current or former employee complies with section 552.1175 of the Government Code, are excepted from disclosure under section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code.

²Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

³We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

⁴As we are able to make this determination, we do not address the OIG's arguments against disclosure.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code. Prior decisions of this office have held that this section renders tax return information confidential. *See* Attorney General Opinion H-1274 (1978) (tax returns); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (W-4 forms), 226 (1979) (W -2 forms). Tax return information is defined as data furnished to or collected by the Internal Revenue Service with respect to the determination of possible existence of liability of any person under title 26 of the United States Code for any tax. *See* 26 U.S.C. § 6103(b). Thus, the submitted W-2 and W-4 forms constitute tax return information that must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law.

Section 552.101 also encompasses criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. We have marked the CHRI that must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. The department has failed to demonstrate how any portion of the remaining information at issue constitutes CHRI for the purposes of chapter 411. Therefore, none of the remaining information may be withheld on that basis.

The remaining information contains fingerprint information. Chapter 560 of the Government Code provides that a governmental body may not release fingerprint information except in certain limited circumstances. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 560.001 (defining “biometric identifier” to include fingerprints), 560.002 (prescribing manner in which biometric identifiers must be maintained and circumstances in which they can be released), 560.003 (providing that biometric identifiers in possession of governmental body are exempt from disclosure under Act). The department does not inform us, and the submitted information does not indicate, that section 560.002 permits the disclosure of the fingerprint information at issue. Therefore, the department must withhold this information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Common-law privacy protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Texas Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). This office has found that some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps).

In addition, this office has found that financial information relating only to an individual ordinarily satisfies the first requirement of the test for common-law privacy, but that there is a legitimate public interest in the essential facts about a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (finding personal financial information to include designation of beneficiary of employee's retirement benefits and optional insurance coverage; choice of particular insurance carrier; direct deposit authorization; and forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care, or dependent care), 545 at 4 (1990) (attorney general has found kinds of financial information not excepted from public disclosure by common-law privacy to generally be those regarding receipt of governmental funds or debts owed to governmental entities). Upon review of the submitted information, we find that portions of it are protected by common-law privacy. The OGC must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, no part of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Therefore, the OGC may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the department must dispose of the information submitted by the OIG in accordance with Open Records Letter No. 2007-16351. The department must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code (1) the submitted I-9 form in conjunction with section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code; (2) the submitted W-2 and W-4 forms in conjunction with federal law; (3) the CHRI we have marked in conjunction with federal law and subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code; (4) the fingerprint information we have marked in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code; and (5) the information we have marked in conjunction with common-law privacy. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the

governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/mcf

Ref: ID# 301026

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Lisa Sandberg
Houston Chronicle
San Antonio Express-News
1005 Congress Avenue, Suite 1060
Austin, Texas 78701
(w/o enclosures)