



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 4, 2008

Ms. Beverly West Stephens
Assistant City Attorney
City of San Antonio
P.O. Box 839966
San Antonio, Texas 78283-3966

OR2008-01532

Dear Ms. Stephens:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 305093.

The San Antonio Police Department (the "department") received a request for information relating to a fatal traffic accident. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and have reviewed the information you submitted.

We first note, and you acknowledge, that the department failed to comply with its deadlines under section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting this decision. Section 552.301 prescribes procedures that a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. Section 552.301(b) requires a governmental body to ask for the attorney general's decision and claim its exceptions to disclosure not later than the tenth business day after the date of its receipt of the written request for information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). Section 552.301(e) requires the governmental body to submit to this office, not later than the fifteenth business day after the date of its receipt of the request, (1) written comments stating why the governmental body's claimed exceptions apply to the information that it seeks to withhold; (2) a copy of the written request for information; (3) a signed statement of the date on which the governmental body received the request, or evidence sufficient to establish that date; and

(4) the specific information that the governmental body seeks to withhold or representative samples if the information is voluminous. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A)-(D). If a governmental body fails to comply with section 552.301, the requested information is presumed to be subject to required public disclosure and must be released, unless there is a compelling reason to withhold any of the information. *See id.* § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ).

Thus, because the department did not comply with its deadlines under subsections 552.301(b) and 552.301(e), the submitted information is presumed to be public under section 552.302. This statutory presumption can generally be overcome when the information is confidential by law or third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 630 at 3 (1994), 325 at 2 (1982). Section 552.108 of the Government Code is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.108 subject to waiver). However, the law enforcement interests under section 552.108 of a governmental body other than the one that failed to comply with section 552.301 can provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure under section 552.302. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 at 2-3 (1991). You inform us that the Bexar County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney") asserts a law enforcement interest in the information at issue. Therefore, we will determine whether the department may withhold the submitted information on behalf of the district attorney under section 552.108. We also will consider your claims under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code, as the applicability of those exceptions also can provide compelling reasons for non-disclosure.

We note that the submitted information includes copies of an accident report form that appear to have been completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code states that except as provided by subsection (c), accident reports are privileged and confidential.¹ *See id.* § 550.065(b). Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three items of information: (1) the date of the accident; (2) the name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) the specific location of the accident. *See id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Texas Department of Transportation or another governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more of the items of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In this instance, the requestor has provided the department with two of the three specified items of information. Therefore, the accident

¹Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information that other statutes make confidential.

reports that we have marked must be released in their entirety pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code.

We also note that one of the submitted documents falls within the scope of section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022 provides for required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record," unless the information is expressly confidential under other law. Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). Section 552.108 is not other law that makes information expressly confidential for the purposes of section 552.022(a)(17). Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the information that is subject to section 552.022(a)(17) under section 552.108. We have marked that information.

The department also seeks to withhold some of the information that is subject to section 552.022 under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state. *See id.* § 552.130(a)(2). We have marked Texas motor vehicle information that must be withheld under section 552.130. The rest of the marked information that is subject to section 552.022(a)(17) must be released.

Next, we address your claim under section 552.108. Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" *Id.* § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body must reasonably explain how and why section 552.108 is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You inform us, and have submitted a letter from the district attorney stating, that the rest of the submitted information is related to a pending criminal case. The district attorney objects to disclosure of the remaining information, asserting that its release would interfere with the investigation and prosecution of a crime. Based on your representation and the district attorney's letter, we conclude that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable in this instance. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases).

Section 552.108 does not except from disclosure "basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic front-page information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88. The department must release basic information, including a detailed description of the offense, even if the information does not literally appear on the front page of an offense or arrest report. *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). The department may withhold the rest of the submitted information on behalf of the district attorney under section 552.108(a)(1).

In summary: (1) the marked accident reports must be released in their entirety pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code; (2) except for the marked Texas motor vehicle information that must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code, the department must release the marked information that is subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code; and (3) the department may withhold the rest of the submitted information on behalf of the district attorney under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code, except for the basic information that must be released under section 552.108(c). As we are able to make these determinations, we need not address your other arguments against disclosure.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or

complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "James W. Morris, III". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

James W. Morris, III
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JWM/ma

Ref: ID# 305093

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Ms. Amber Vercautrin
Progressive County Mutual Insurance Company
4400 Northwest Loop 410 Suite 200
San Antonio, Texas 78229
(w/o enclosures)