



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 27, 2008

Ms. Sylvia McClellan
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2008-04058

Dear Ms. McClellan:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 309775.

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified offense report. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note, and you acknowledge, that you did not comply with the time period prescribed by section 552.301(b) of the Government Code in seeking an open records decision from this office. When a governmental body fails to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 the information at issue is presumed public. *See Gov't Code* § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ). To overcome this presumption, the governmental body must show a compelling reason to withhold the information. *See Gov't Code* § 552.302; *Hancock*, 797 S.W.2d at 381. Generally, a compelling reason exists when some other source of law makes the information confidential or third party interests are at stake. *See Open Records Decision* No. 630 at 3 (1994). Because section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to withhold information, we will address your arguments concerning this exception.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. The relevant language of section 58.007 reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c), (e), (j). Section 58.007 makes confidential juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after

September 1, 1997. After reviewing the submitted offense report, we find that it pertains to a juvenile runaway whose conduct occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03(b)(3) (defining "conduct indicating a need for supervision" to include "the voluntary absence of a child from the child's home without the consent of the child's parent or guardian for a substantial length of time or without intent to return"). Thus, this information is subject to section 58.007. We note, however, that the requestor here is the mother of the juvenile listed in the report. Under section 58.007(e), the requestor may inspect law enforcement records concerning her own child. *Id.* § 58.007(e). However, section 58.007(j)(2) provides that information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must be redacted. Accordingly, we will address your remaining claims under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides:

(a) The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Id. § 261.201(a). Upon review of the submitted information, we find that you have not demonstrated that this information consists of files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, or working papers used or developed in an investigation of child abuse or neglect. Therefore, section 261.201 of the Family Code is not applicable to the submitted information, and it may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that ground.

Finally, section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683; *see also Hubert v. Harte-Hanks Tex. Newspapers, Inc.*,

652 S.W.2d 546, 551 (Tex. App.—Austin 1983, writ ref'd n.r.e.). However, we find that the information you have marked is not protected by common-law privacy, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that ground. Accordingly, the department must release the submitted information to the requestor pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or

¹We note that because the requestor has a special right of access to the submitted information in this instance, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.

complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Katherine M. Kroll". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name being the most prominent.

Katherine M. Kroll
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KMK/sdk

Ref: ID# 309775

Enc. Submitted documents