



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 22, 2008

Ms. Patricia Fleming
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
Office of the General Counsel
P.O. Box 4004
Huntsville, Texas 77342-4004

OR2008-05289

Dear Ms. Fleming:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 309031.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for information relating to a specified inmate. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.134 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note, and you acknowledge, that the department has not complied with the time period prescribed by section 552.301(b) of the Government Code in requesting a decision from this office. When a governmental body fails to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301, the information at issue is presumed public. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *City of Houston v. Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co.*, 673 S.W.2d 316, 323 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, no writ); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). To overcome this presumption, the governmental body must show a compelling reason to withhold the information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock*, 797 S.W.2d at 381. Normally, a compelling reason for non-disclosure exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 630 at 3 (1994), 325 at 2 (1982). Because your claims

under sections 552.101 and 552.134 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons for non-disclosure, we will address these exceptions.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by statute, including section 508.313 of the Government Code, which provides in part:

(a) All information obtained and maintained [by the Texas Department of Criminal Justice], including a victim protest letter or other correspondence, a victim impact statement, a list of inmates eligible for release on parole, and an arrest record of an inmate, is confidential and privileged if the information relates to:

(1) an inmate of the institutional division [of the Texas Department of Criminal Justice] subject to release on parole, release to mandatory supervision, or executive clemency;

(2) a releasee; or

(3) a person directly identified in any proposed plan of release for an inmate.

...

(c) The [Texas Department of Criminal Justice], on request or in the normal course of official business, shall provide information that is confidential and privileged under Subsection (a) to:

(1) the governor;

(2) a member of the [B]oard [of Pardons and Paroles] or a parole commissioner;

(3) the Criminal Justice Policy Council in performing duties of the council under Section 413.017 [of the Government Code]; or

(4) an eligible entity requesting information for a law enforcement, prosecutorial, correctional, clemency, or treatment purpose [.]

Gov’t Code § 508.313(a), (c); *See also id.* §508.001 (“releasee” means a person released on parole or to mandatory supervision). We note that section 508.313 is explicitly made subject to section 552.029 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 508.313(f); §552.029(8). You inform

us that the submitted information is maintained by the department's parole division as a part of an inmate's parole file. After reviewing your arguments and the submitted information, we agree that the submitted information is made confidential by section 508.313 and may only be released in accordance with that statute. Furthermore, the requestor is not an entity authorized by section 508.313(c) to obtain this information. Accordingly, the department must withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 508.313 of the Government Code.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure.

complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Olivia A. Maceo". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial "O" and a distinct "Maceo" ending.

Olivia A. Maceo
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

OM/mcf

Ref: ID# 309031

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Claude Reidenbach
P.O. Box 424
Greeneville, Tennessee 37744
(w/o enclosures)