



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

May 6, 2008

Mr. Ronald J. Bounds  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Corpus Christi  
P.O. Box 9277  
Corpus Christi, Texas 78469-9277

OR2008-06138

Dear Mr. Bounds:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 309364.

The City of Corpus Christi (the "city") received a request for the consumer confidence report and information pertaining to the city's use of fluoride. You state that you have released most of the requested information. You claim that a portion of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the information you have submitted.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides:

(a) In this section, "access device" means a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to:

- (1) obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value; or
- (2) initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument.

(b) Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.

Gov't Code § 552.136. A governmental body must explain, unless it is clear from the face of the document, how the information it seeks to withhold constitutes an access device number for purposes of section 552.136. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); Open Records Decision Nos. 542 (1990) (concluding that Act places on governmental body burden of establishing which exceptions apply to requested information and why), 532 (1989), 515 (1988), 252 (1980). Historically, this office has allowed governmental bodies to withhold certain types of access device numbers, such as bank account numbers, credit card numbers, and insurance policy numbers, under section 552.136 because it is obvious how these types of numbers can be used alone or in conjunction with another device to obtain money, goods, or services, or to initiate transfers of funds. *See Gov't Code* § 552.136(a), (b). You seek to withhold the account number you have marked in the submitted invoice. In this instance, however, you have merely recited the key terms of section 552.136(a)(2) in your argument for withholding the marked information and have not explained how the marked account number, whether used alone or in conjunction with another device, may be used to initiate a transfer of funds. Thus, we find that you have failed to explain how the account number you have marked constitutes an "access device number" for purposes of section 552.136. Therefore, the city may not withhold the information you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. As you have raised no other exceptions to disclosure, the submitted information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the

Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Melanie J. Villars  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

MJV/jh

Ref: ID# 309364

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Margaret Hayes  
10622 Gettysburg  
Corpus Christi, Texas 78410  
(w/o enclosures)