



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 22, 2008

Ms. J. Middlebrooks
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
Criminal Law and Police Section
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2008-07068

Dear Ms. Middlebrooks:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 309532.

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received two separate requests for information regarding two named police officers. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.117, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.138 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note that the submitted documents include a custodial death report. Article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure provides that with the exception of any portion of the custodial death report that the Office of the Attorney General (the "OAG") determines is privileged, the attorney general shall make the report public. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 49.18(b). The report was revised in May 2006 and now consists of four pages and

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

an attached summary of how the death occurred. The OAG has determined that the four-page report and summary must be released to the public but that any other documents submitted with the revised report are confidential under article 49.18(b). In this instance, you have submitted a four-page custodial death report with an attached summary. The department must release the submitted custodial death report and summary, which we have marked, pursuant to article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 58.007(c) provides as follows:

Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Some of the submitted documents contain information that involves juvenile delinquent conduct occurring after September 1, 1997. None of the exceptions in section 58.007 appears to apply. Therefore, this information, which we have marked, is confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and the department must withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code. However, the remaining information at issue consists of an internal administrative investigation of the report at issue. The administrative investigation documents do not consist of juvenile law enforcement records for purposes of section 58.007; therefore, this information is not confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that ground.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or

prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). We note that section 552.108 is generally not applicable to information relating to an internal administrative investigation that did not result in a criminal investigation or prosecution. *See Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519, 525-26 (Tex. Civ. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 not applicable to internal investigation that did not result in criminal investigation or prosecution); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 350 at 3-4 (1982). You state that the Dallas County District Attorney objects to the release of this information because it would interfere with the district attorney’s criminal investigation of this incident. Based on these representations and our review, we conclude that the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the administrative investigation.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information made public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the administrative investigation information pursuant to section 552.108(a)(1).

Section 552.101 also encompasses information protected by other statutes, including criminal history record information (“CHRI”). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* ORD 565. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in

conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. *See* Gov't Code § 411.082(2)(B) (term CHRI does not include driving record information). We have marked the CHRI in the remaining submitted information that the department must withhold under section 552.101 in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 560.003 of the Government Code, which provides that "[a] biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under [the Act]." *Id.* § 560.003; *see id.* § 560.001(1) ("biometric identifier" means retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry). You have marked fingerprints in the submitted information that are confidential under section 560.003. There is no indication that the requestor has a right of access to the fingerprints under section 560.002. *See id.* § 560.002(1)(A) (governmental body may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose individual's biometric identifier to another person unless the individual consents to disclosure). Therefore, the department must withhold the marked fingerprints under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common law privacy. Common law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.*

Portions of the remaining submitted information relate to an alleged sexual assault. Information tending to identify victims of serious sexual offenses is protected by common law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 440 (1986), 393 (1983), 339 (1982); *Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519 (identity of witnesses to and victims of sexual harassment was highly intimate or embarrassing information and public did not have a legitimate interest in such information). Accordingly, the department must withhold the complainant's identifying information that we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with the common law privacy.

This office also has found that personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally intimate and embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990), 523 (1989) (public employee's withholding allowance certificate, designation of beneficiary of employee's retirement benefits, direct deposit authorization, and employee's decisions regarding voluntary benefits programs, among others, protected under common law privacy). In addition, this office has found that some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or

specific illnesses is protected by common law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Therefore, the department also must withhold the beneficiary, loan, and medical information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy.

Information may also be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy upon a showing of "special circumstances." *See* Open Records Decision No. 169 (1977). This office considers "special circumstances" to refer to a very narrow set of situations in which release of the information would likely cause someone to face "an imminent threat of physical danger." *Id.* at 6. "Special circumstances" do not include "a generalized and speculative fear of harassment or retribution." *Id.* You seek to withhold the address of a domestic violence shelter. You explain that the physical address is only given to law enforcement officers and others on a need to know basis. You further explain that the facility is located in a secluded, gated area, and that the address is not located on the group's website or published on protective orders. You assert that it is necessary to withhold the address for the safety of clients and personnel. Upon review, we agree that release of the address at issue would place the clients and personnel of the domestic violence shelter in imminent danger. Accordingly, the department must withhold the address at issue, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common law privacy.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code exempts from public disclosure a peace officer's home address and telephone number, social security number, and family member information, regardless of whether the peace officer made an election under section 552.024 of the Government Code. Gov't Code § 552.117 (a)(2). We note, however, that a post office box number does not constitute a "home address" for purposes of section 552.117, and must be released.² We also note that the protections of section 552.117 of the Government Code only apply to information that the governmental body holds in its capacity as an employer. *See* Gov't Code § 552.117 (providing that employees of governmental entities may protect certain personal information in the hands of their employer); *see also id.* § 552.024 (establishing election process for section 552.117). Upon review, we agree that the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code, except as we have marked for release. We note that the remaining offense report lists the peace officer at issue as a suspect. As such, the peace officer's personal information included in the offense report may not be withheld under section 552.117(a)(2). However, this information may be excepted under section 552.1175 of the Government Code, which provides in part as follows:

²*See generally*, Open Records Decision No. 622 at 4 (1994) (purpose of confidentiality provision excepting public employee's personal information from required disclosure is to protect them from being harassed at home) (citing House Committee on State Affairs, Bill Analysis, H.B. 1976, 69th Leg. (1985)).

(b) Information that relates to the home address, home telephone number, or social security number of [a peace officer as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure], or that reveals whether the individual has family members is confidential and may not be disclosed to the public under this chapter if the individual to whom the information relates:

- (1) chooses to restrict public access to the information; and
- (2) notifies the governmental body of the individual's choice on a form provided by the governmental body, accompanied by evidence of the individual's status.

Id. § 552.1175(b). If the peace officer at issue notifies the department that he chooses to keep his personal information contained in the submitted offense report confidential in accordance with section 552.1175(b)(2), the department must withhold this information pursuant to section 552.1175 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130 (a)(1), (2). The department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information that you have marked, as well as additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 (b) states that "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." *Id.* § 552.136. You inform us that an employee's identification number is also used as an employee's credit union bank account number. Thus, the department must withhold the information that you have marked, as well as the additional information we have marked, under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Finally, we note that some of the submitted materials are copyrighted. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Attorney General Opinion JM-672 (1987). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.* If a member of the public wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit. *See* Open Records Decision No. 550 (1990).

In summary, under section 552.101 of the Government Code, the department must withhold 1) the information we have marked in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, 2) the CHRI we have marked in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411

of the Government Code, 3) the fingerprints you have marked in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code, and 4) the complainant's identifying information; the beneficiary, loan, and medical information; and the address of the domestic violence shelter we have marked in conjunction with common law privacy. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the administrative investigation information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information you have marked, except as we have marked for release, under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.1175 of the Government Code, if the officer notifies the department that he chooses to keep such information confidential. The department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked, as well as the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information that you have marked, as well as the additional information we have marked, under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.³ Information that is subject to copyright must be released in accordance with that law.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline,

³Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Benjamin A. Diener
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BAD/jb

Ref: ID# 309532

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Tanya Eiserer
Staff Writer
The Dallas Morning News
508 Young Street
Dallas, Texas 75202
(w/o enclosures)