



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

May 23, 2008

Ms. Ashley D. Fourt
Assistant District Attorney
Tarrant County Criminal District Attorney's Office
401 West Belknap
Fort Worth, Texas 76196-0201

OR2008-07096

Dear Ms. Fourt:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 316568.

The Tarrant County Sheriff's Department (the "sheriff") received a request for information relating to a specified case number. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and have reviewed the information you submitted.

We first note that the submitted information includes the results of an analysis of a breath specimen. Section 724.018 of the Transportation Code provides that on the request of the person who has given a specimen at the request of a peace officer, full information concerning the analysis of the specimen must be made available to that person or the person's attorney. In this instance, the requestor is the person who provided the breath specimen at the request of a peace officer. Therefore, the submitted results of the analysis of the breath specimen must be released to this requestor pursuant to section 724.018 of the Transportation Code.

We also note that the submitted information includes the requestor's fingerprints. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."¹ Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information that other statutes make

¹Unlike other exceptions to disclosure, this office will raise section 552.101 on behalf of a governmental body, because the Act prescribes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. See Gov't Code §§ 552.007, .352; Open Records Decision No. 325 at 2 (1982).

confidential. Section 560.003 of the Government Code provides that “[a] biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under [the Act].” *Id.* § 560.003; *see id.* § 560.001(1) (“biometric identifier” means retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry). Section 560.002 of the Government Code provides, however, that “[a] governmental body that possesses a biometric identifier of an individual . . . may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose the biometric identifier to another person unless . . . the individual consents to the disclosure[.]” *Id.* § 560.002(1)(A). Thus, the fingerprints that we have marked must be released to this requestor pursuant to section 560.002(1)(A). *See* Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself).

The submitted information also includes an accident report that was completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer’s accident report). Section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code states that except as provided by subsection (c), accident reports are privileged and confidential. *See id.* § 550.065(b). Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three items of information: (1) the date of the accident; (2) the name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) the specific location of the accident. *See id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Texas Department of Transportation or another governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more of the items of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In this instance, the requestor has not provided the sheriff with two of the three specified items of information. Therefore, the sheriff must withhold the submitted accident report pursuant to section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code.

We next note that section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code is applicable to one of the submitted documents. Section 552.022(a)(17) provides for required public disclosure of “information that is also contained in a public court record,” unless the information is expressly confidential under other law. Gov’t Code § 552.022(a)(17). We have marked the document that is subject to section 552.022(a)(17). Although you seek to withhold that document under section 552.108 of the Government Code, section 552.108 is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body’s interests and may be waived. *See id.* § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to Gov’t Code § 552.108 subject to waiver). As such, section 552.108 is not other law that makes information expressly confidential for the purposes of section 552.022(a)(17). Therefore, the marked document that is subject to section 552.022(a)(17) may not be withheld under section 552.108 and must be released.

You seek to withhold the remaining information under section 552.108, which excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would

interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body must reasonably explain how and why section 552.108 is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the rest of the submitted information is related to a pending criminal prosecution. Based on your representation, we conclude that section 552.108(a)(1) is generally applicable to the remaining information. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases).

Section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic front-page information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88. The sheriff must release basic information, including a detailed description of the offense, even if the information does not literally appear on the front page of an offense or arrest report. *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). The sheriff may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1).

In summary: (1) the results of the analysis of the breath specimen must be released pursuant to section 724.018 of the Transportation Code; (2) the requestor’s fingerprints must be released pursuant to section 560.002(1)(A) of the Government Code; (3) the accident report must be withheld pursuant to section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code; (4) the marked court record must be released pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code; and (5) the sheriff may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code, except for the basic information that must be released under section 552.108(c).²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in

²We note that the submitted information also contains the arrested person’s social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. The requestor has a right, however, to his own social security number. *See generally* Gov’t Code § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates, or that person’s representative, solely on grounds that information is considered confidential by privacy principles).

Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



James W. Morris, III
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JWM/ma

Ref: ID# 316568

Enc: Submitted documents

c:

[REDACTED]