



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 3, 2008

Ms. P. Armstrong
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
Criminal Law and Police Section
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2008-07539

Dear Ms. Armstrong:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 316243.

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received two requests for service report number 119242-V and accident report number 119330V, and a third request for a copy of the 9-1-1 call related to the same fatal accident. You claim that some of the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note that the submitted information contains an accident report form that was completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory,

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code states that except as provided by subsection (c), accident reports are privileged and confidential. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Texas Department of Transportation or another governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *Id.* Neither requestor has provided the department with two of the three pieces of information; thus, the department must withhold the accident report from these two requestors under section 550.065(b).²

Criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center (“NCIC”) or by the Texas Crime Information Center (“TCIC”) is confidential. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* ORD 565. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. We note that because the laws that govern the dissemination of information obtained from NCIC and TCIC are based on both law enforcement and privacy interests, the CHRI of a deceased individual that is obtained from a criminal justice agency may be disseminated only as permitted by subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. *See* ORD 565 at 10-12. We have marked the information that constitutes CHRI and is confidential under section 411.083. Therefore, the information we have marked must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or

²We note that the third requestor (Jones) did not request the accident report.

prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that report number 0119242-V pertains to a pending criminal investigation. Based on your representation, we conclude that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to this report. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App. —Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Thus, you may withhold the marked portions of report number 0119242-V under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

You assert that some of the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code, which excepts from public disclosure information that relates to a driver’s license or motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state. Gov’t Code § 552.130. We note that some of the submitted information pertains to motor vehicle record information of a deceased person. Section 552.130 protects the privacy interest of the individual, and because that right of privacy is purely personal, it lapses upon death. *See Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enterprises, Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489 (Tex. Civ. App. — Texarkana 1979, *writ ref’d n.r.e.*) (Texas does not recognize relational or derivative right of privacy); *see also* Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984); H-917 (1976); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981). Thus, motor vehicle information pertaining to a deceased person may not be withheld under section 552.130. Accordingly, to the extent the Texas motor vehicle information you have marked, as well as the information we have marked, pertains to a living person, it must be withheld under section 552.130; however, this information may not be withheld under section 552.130 if it pertains to a deceased individual.

In summary, the department must withhold the accident report from the first two requestors under section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code. We have marked the information that is confidential under section 411.083 and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the marked portions of report number 0097817-V under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. To the extent the marked Texas motor vehicle information pertains to a living person, it must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the

governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/mcf

Ref: ID# 316243

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Bob Clark
Attorney at Law
4627 North Central Expressway
Dallas, Texas 75205
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Robert Lowry
Lowry Claim Services, Inc.
8828 Stemmons Freeway, Suite 340
Dallas, Texas 75247
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Ralph Jones
Jones & Geisler, Attorneys
3400 Carlisle, Suite 300
Dallas, Texas 75204
(w/o enclosures)