



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 9, 2008

Ms. Laura C. Rodriguez
Walsh, Anderson, Brown, Schulze & Aldridge
P.O. Box 460606
San Antonio, Texas 78246

OR2008-07787

Dear Ms. Rodriguez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 318190.

The Southwest Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a named teacher. You state that some of the requested information has been released, but claim that some of the submitted information is exempted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code provides that an Employment Eligibility Verification Form I-9 "may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter" and for enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. *See* 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); *see also* 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). Release of this form under the Act would be "for purposes other than for enforcement" of the referenced federal provisions. Accordingly, the submitted I-9 form is confidential under section 552.101 and may only be released in compliance with the federal laws and regulations governing the employment verification system.¹

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address your other argument to withhold this information.

You assert that some of the remaining information is excepted under section 552.130 of the Government Code, which provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). We agree that the district must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130.

We note the requestor is an investigator for the Texas Education Agency ("TEA"). TEA's request states that it is seeking this information under the authority provided to the State Board for Educator Certification ("SBEC") by section 249.14 of title 19 of the Texas Administrative Code.² Accordingly, we will consider whether section 249.14 of title 19 of the Texas Administrative Code permits TEA to obtain information that is otherwise protected by the exceptions discussed above. *See* Open Records Decision No. 451 at 4 (1986) (specific access provision prevails over generally applicable exception to public disclosure).

Chapter 249 of title 19 of the Texas Administrative Code governs disciplinary proceedings, sanctions, and contested cases involving SBEC. *See* 19 T.A.C. § 249.1. Section 249.14 provides in relevant part:

(a) Staff [of TEA] may obtain and investigate information concerning alleged improper conduct by an educator, applicant, examinee, or other person subject to this chapter that would warrant the board denying relief to or taking disciplinary action against the person or certificate.

...

(c) The executive director and staff may also obtain and act on other information providing grounds for investigation and possible action under this chapter.

(d) A person who serves as the superintendent of a school district or the director of an open-enrollment charter school, private school, regional education service center, or shared services arrangement shall promptly notify [TEA] in writing . . . by filing a report with the executive director within seven calendar days of the date the person first obtains or has knowledge of information indicating any of the following circumstances:

²Chapter 21 of the Education Code authorizes SBEC to regulate and oversee all aspects of the certification, continuing education, and standards of conduct of public school educators. *See* Educ. Code § 21.031(a). Section 21.041 of the Education Code states that SBEC may "provide for disciplinary proceedings, including the suspension or revocation of an educator certificate, as provided by Chapter 2001, Government Code." *Id.* § 21.041(b)(7). Section 21.041 also authorizes SBEC to "adopt rules as necessary for its own procedures." *Id.* § 21.041(a).

(1) that an applicant for or a holder of a certificate has a reported criminal history;

(2) that a certificate holder was terminated from employment based on a determination that he or she committed any of the following acts:

(A) sexually or physically abused a minor or engaged in any other illegal conduct with a minor;

(B) possessed, transferred, sold, or distributed a controlled substance;

(C) illegally transferred, appropriated, or expended school property or funds;

(D) attempted by fraudulent or unauthorized means to obtain or to alter any certificate or permit that would entitle the individual to be employed in a position requiring such certificate or permit or to receive additional compensation associated with a position; or

(E) committed a crime, any part of such crime having occurred on school property or at a school-sponsored event, or;

(3) that a certificate holder resigned and reasonable evidence supported a recommendation by the person to terminate a certificate holder because he or she committed one of the acts specified in paragraph (2) of this subsection.

...

(e) A report filed under subsection (d) of this section shall, at a minimum, summarize the factual circumstances requiring the report and identify the subject of the report by providing the following available information: name and any aliases; certificate number, if any, or social security number; and last known mailing address and home and daytime phone numbers. A person who is required to file a report under subsection (d) of this section but fails to do so timely is subject to sanctions under this chapter.

19 T.A.C. § 249.14. We note that these regulations do not specifically grant access to information subject to section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code or section 552.130 of the Government Code. We further note that section 1324a and section 552.130 each has its own access provisions governing release for the respective types of information to which

each is applicable. If confidentiality provisions or another statute specifically authorize release of information under certain circumstances or to particular entities, then the information may only be released or transferred in accordance therewith. *See* Attorney General Opinions GA-0055 (2003) at 3-4 (SBEC not entitled to access teacher appraisals made confidential by section 21.355 of the Education Code where section 21.352 of the Education Code expressly authorizes limited release of appraisals), DM-353 (1995) at 4-5 n.6 (detailed provisions in state law for disclosure of records would not permit disclosure “to other governmental entities and officials . . . without violating the record’s confidentiality”), JM-590 (1986) at 5 (“express mention or enumeration of one person, thing, consequence, or class is tantamount to an express exclusion of all others”); Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (because statute permitted Department of Public Safety to transfer confidential criminal history information only to certain entities for certain purposes, county could not obtain information from the department regarding applicants for county employment). We also note that an interagency transfer of this information is not permissible where, as here, the applicable statutes enumerate the specific entities to which information encompassed by the statute may be disclosed, and the enumerated entities do not include the requesting governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 655 at 8-9 (1997), 516 at 4-5 (1989), 490 at 2 (1988); *see also* Attorney General Opinion GA-0055.

Furthermore, where general and specific statutes are in irreconcilable conflict, the specific provision typically prevails as an exception to the general provision unless the general provision was enacted later and there is clear evidence that the legislature intended the general provision to prevail. *See* Gov’t Code § 311.026(b); *City of Lake Dallas v. Lake Cities Mun. Util. Auth.*, 555 S.W.2d 163, 168 (Tex. Civ. App.—Fort Worth 1977, writ ref’d n.r.e.). In this instance, although section 249.14 generally allows TEA access to information relating to suspected misconduct on the part of an educator, section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code and section 552.130 of the Government Code specifically protect employment verification forms and motor vehicle record information, and specifically permit release to certain parties and in certain circumstances that do not include TEA’s request in this instance. We therefore conclude that, notwithstanding the provisions of section 249.14, the district must withhold the information that you have marked under section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code and section 552.130 of the Government Code. *See also* Open Records Decision No. 629 (1994) (provision of Bingo Enabling Act that specifically provided for non-disclosure of information obtained in connection with examination of books and records of applicant or licensee prevailed over provision that generally provided for public access to applications, returns, reports, statements and audits submitted to or conducted by Texas Alcoholic Beverage Commission). The district must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited

from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/jh

Ref: ID# 318190

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Thomas Rivera, Investigator
Texas Education Agency
Office of Investigations
Educator Certification and Standards
1701 Congress Ave., Suite 5-105
Austin, Texas 78701-1494
(w/o enclosures)