



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 18, 2008

Ms. Patricia E. Carls
Carls, McDonald & Dalrymple, LLP
Barton Oaks Plaza 2
901 South Mopac Expressway, Suite 500
Austin, Texas 78746

OR2008-09820

Dear Ms. Carls:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 316820.

The Sunset Valley Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for 12 categories of information related to a specified incident and the requestor's clients. You state that you have released some of the requested information, but you claim that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, you inform us that some of the submitted information was subject to a previous request for information, in response to which this office issued Open Records Letter No. 2007-10687 (2007). In the prior ruling, this office determined that the information the department had marked was excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. You inform us that the facts and circumstances have changed since the issuance of our previous ruling. In the previous request, the department asserted that release of the marked information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime because it pertained to a pending criminal prosecution. However, you inform us that the prosecution has now concluded. Therefore, as relevant facts have changed since the issuance of Open Records Letter Ruling No. 2007-10687, we conclude that the department may not rely on that ruling as a previous determination. *See* Open Records

Decision No. 673 (2001) (describing the four criteria for a “previous determination”). Accordingly, we will consider the applicability of the exceptions you claim.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as the Medical Practice Act (the “MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. The MPA governs the public availability of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(a)-(c). This office has determined that in governing access to a specific subset of information, the MPA prevails over the more general provisions of the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Although you contend that some of the submitted information is confidential under the MPA, you have failed to demonstrate how any of the information at issue constitutes medical records for the purposes of the MPA. We therefore conclude that the department may not withhold any of the submitted information on the basis of the MPA.

Section 552.101 also encompasses chapter 411 of the Government Code, which deems confidential criminal history information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” Gov’t Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of

Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Although you indicate that the submitted information contains criminal history information that is confidential under chapter 411, upon review we find that none of the submitted information constitutes CHRI for the purposes of chapter 411. Therefore, the department may not withhold any portion of the submitted information on that basis.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. In addition, this office has found that some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Accordingly, the department must withhold the information that we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the remaining information is not highly intimate or embarrassing, or there is a legitimate public interest in the information. Therefore, no portion of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure "information [that] relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state." Gov't Code § 552.130. We note, however, that section 552.130 protects privacy interests. The requestor states that he is the authorized representative of two of the individuals to whom some of the information at issue pertains. Thus, the requestor has a right of access to his clients' Texas motor vehicle record information and the department may not withhold this information in this instance.¹ *See id.* § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual or authorized representative asks governmental body to provide information concerning that individual). The department must, however, withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information that does not belong to the requestor's clients. Thus, except where we have marked for release, the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle

¹Section 552.023(a) provides that "[a] person or a person's authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests." Gov't Code § 552.023(a).

record information you have marked, as well as the information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Except where we have marked for release, the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked, as well as the information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3). If the governmental body does not file suit over this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental

²We note that the remaining information contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. We note, however, that the requestor has a right of access to his clients' social security numbers pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023. Should the department receive another request for this information from an individual other than this requestor, the department should again seek our decision.

body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Jordan Hale
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JH/jb

Ref: ID# 316820

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Thomas Herald
Montes Herald Law Group, L.L.P.
1121 Kinwest Parkway, Suite 100
Irving, Texas 75063
(w/o enclosures)