



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

July 24, 2008

Ms. Michelle T. Rangel  
Assistant County Attorney  
Fort Bend County  
301 Jackson Street, Suite 728  
Richmond, Texas 77469-3108

OR2008-10057

Dear Ms. Rangel:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 316895.

The Fort Bend County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff") received a request for the internal affairs disciplinary history for four named officers and any administrative letters in one of the officers personnel file. You state that you will release some of the requested information. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Next, we note that portions of the submitted information are subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022 provides that:

the following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure under this chapter unless they are expressly confidential under other law:

- (1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108.

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). In this instance, the submitted information contains completed internal affairs investigations made for or by the sheriff. The sheriff must release the completed investigations under section 552.022(a)(1) of the Government Code unless they are excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or are expressly confidential under other law. Because information subject to section 552.022(a)(1) may be withheld under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147, we will address the sheriff's arguments for the submitted information under these exceptions.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). We note that this exception is generally not applicable to records of an internal affairs investigation that is purely administrative in nature and does not involve the investigation or prosecution of crime. *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.), *Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519, 525-26 (Tex. Civ. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 not applicable to internal investigation that did not result in criminal investigation or prosecution). You state that the submitted information pertains to a concluded investigations that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. We have marked a portion of the information that pertains to a criminal investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication and is subject to section 552.108(a)(2). However, the remaining information at issue consists of internal affairs investigations that were purely administrative in nature. Therefore, section 552.108 is not applicable to the remaining information.

We note, however, that section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the sheriff may withhold the information we have marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Next, section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses chapter 411 of the Government Code. Criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center ("NCIC") or by the Texas Crime Information Center ("TCIC") is confidential. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to

another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* ORD 565. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. However, we note that driving record information is not made confidential by the confidentiality provisions that govern CHRI. *See* Gov't Code § 411.082(2)(b) (definition of CHRI does not include driving record information). We have marked the information that constitutes CHRI generated by TCIC and NCIC and is confidential under section 411.083. Accordingly, the criminal history record information that we have marked must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

You also raise section 552.101 in conjunction with the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both elements of the test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. We note, however, that records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history record information. *Cf.* Gov't Code § 411.082(2)(B) (criminal history record information does not include driving record information). We have marked the information that is subject to common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information relating to a Texas motor vehicle driver's license and information relating to a Texas motor vehicle title or registration. Gov't Code § 552.130. We have marked the Texas motor vehicle record information that the sheriff must withhold under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

You also raise section 552.147 of the Government Code, which provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the

Act.<sup>1</sup> Gov't Code § 552.147(a). The sheriff may withhold the social security numbers contained in the submitted documents under section 552.147.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, the sheriff may withhold the information we have marked under section 552.108(a)(2). The sheriff must withhold the criminal history record information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code and the information we have marked under common-law privacy under section 552.101 of the Government Code. The sheriff must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code and may withhold the submitted social security numbers under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3). If the governmental body does not file suit over this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

---

<sup>1</sup>We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Jonathan Miles  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JM/jh

Ref: ID# 316895

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. R. J. Vargas  
3700 North Main Street  
Houston, Texas 77009  
(w/o enclosures)