



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 12, 2008

Mr. Eric Stuebner
Assistant District Attorney
Dallas County—Frank Crowley Courts Building
133 North Industrial Boulevard, LB-19
Dallas, Texas 75207-4399

OR2008-10976

Dear Mr. Stuebner:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the “Act”), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 318990.

The Dallas County District Attorney’s Office (the “district attorney”) received a request for a specified grand jury transcript, including all supporting documents “used, reviewed, or furnished during the hearing and deliberations.” You state that the district attorney does not maintain a copy of the requested transcript.¹ You claim that the submitted supporting documents are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information that other statutes make confidential, including the Medical Practice Act (the “MPA”), Occ. Code §§ 151.001-165.160. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides:

¹The Act does not require a governmental body that receives a request for information to create information that did not exist when the request was received. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 563 at 8 (1990), 555 at 1-2 (1990).

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002. This office has concluded that the protection afforded by section 59.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). We have also found that when a file is created as the result of a hospital stay, all the documents in the file relating to diagnosis and treatment constitute physician-patient communications or "[r]ecords of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that are created or maintained by a physician." Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990). We note that section 159.001 of the MPA defines "patient" as a person who consults with or is seen by a physician to receive medical care. *See* Occ. Code § 159.001(3). Under this definition, a deceased person cannot be a "patient" under section 159.002 of the MPA. Thus, section 159.002 is applicable only to the medical records of a person who was alive at the time of the diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment.

Upon review, we have marked medical records that are subject to the MPA. We note, however, that the requestor is the attorney for the estate of the individual to whom the medical records pertain. Medical records pertaining to a deceased individual may be released only on the signed consent of the personal representative of the deceased. *Id.* § 159.005(a)(5). The consent must specify (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *Id.* §§ 159.004, .005. Section 159.002(c) also requires that any subsequent release of medical records be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). Accordingly, the submitted medical records may only be released in accordance with the MPA.

We note that the submitted documents contain emergency medical service ("EMS") records. Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code, which pertains to EMS records. Access to EMS records is governed by the

provisions of section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Section 773.091 provides in part the following:

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

...

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services.

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(b), (g). Upon review, we have marked documents that constitute confidential EMS records. As stated above, the requestor appears to be the personal representative of a deceased EMS patient. We note that records that are confidential under section 773.091 may be disclosed to “any person who bears a written consent of the patient or other persons authorized to act on the patient's behalf for the release of confidential information.” Health & Safety Code §§ 773.092(e)(4), .093. Among the individuals authorized to act on the patient's behalf in providing written consent is a “personal representative” if the patient is deceased. *Id.* Section 773.093 provides that a consent for release of EMS records must specify: (1) the information or records to be covered by the release; (2) the reasons or purpose for the release; and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. Thus, except for the information subject to section 773.091(g), which is not confidential, the district attorney may only release the EMS records at issue upon receipt of proper consent under section 773.093(a). *See id.* §§ 773.092, .093.

You assert that the remaining information at issue is subject to section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]” Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). Section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable only if the information at issue relates to a concluded criminal case that did not result in a conviction or a deferred adjudication. A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information that the governmental body seeks to withhold. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state, and provide documentation showing, that the remaining information at issue pertains to a concluded

criminal case that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. Therefore, we agree that section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the remaining information.

As you acknowledge, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). See Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic, front page offense information, you may withhold the remaining information at issue under section 552.108(a)(2).

In summary, the district attorney may only release the marked medical and EMS records in accordance with the MPA and chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code, respectively. Except for basic information, the remaining information at issue may be withheld under section 552.108(a)(2).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3). If the governmental body does not file suit over this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Reg Hargrove
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RJH/eeg

Ref: ID# 318990

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Daryl K. Washington
Shackelford, Melton, & McKinley
3333 Lee Parkway, Tenth Floor
Dallas, Texas 75219
(w/o enclosures)