



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 22, 2008

Mr. John C. West
OIG General Counsel
4616 Howard Lane, Suite 250
Austin, Texas 78728

OR2008-12982

Dear Mr. West:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 322503.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice Office of the Inspector General (the "OIG") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident involving a named inmate. You state that the OIG will release some information to the requestor with redactions pursuant to the previous determination issued by this office in Open Records Letter No. 2005-01067 (2005).¹ You also state that you are withholding social security numbers under section 552.147 of the Government Code.² You claim that the submitted investigation file is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.108, 552.117, 552.1175, 552.130, and 552.134 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

¹Open Records Letter No. 2005-01067 serves as a previous determination that the present and former home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former employees of the Texas Department of Criminal Justice, regardless of whether the current or former employee complies with section 552.1175 of the Government Code, are excepted from disclosure under section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code.

²Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Some of the submitted information constitutes medical records, access to which is governed by the Medical Practice Act ("MPA"). Occ. Code §§ 151.001-165.160. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002(a)-(c). This office has concluded that the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Furthermore, we have concluded that when a file is created as the result of a hospital stay, all of the documents in the file that relate to diagnosis and treatment constitute either physician-patient communications or records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that are created or maintained by a physician. *See* Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990).

We note that the requestor represents the named inmate and may have a right of access to the medical records under the MPA. This office has determined that in governing access to a specific subset of information, the MPA prevails over the more general provisions of the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). We have marked the medical records that are subject to the MPA and may only be released in accordance with Chapter 159 of the Occupations Code. *See* ORD No. 598.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 611.002 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides in part:

(a) Communications between a patient and a professional, and records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient that are created or maintained by a professional, are confidential.

(b) Confidential communications or records may not be disclosed except as provided by Section 611.004 or 611.0045.

Health & Safety Code § 611.002(a)-(b); *see also id.* § 611.001 (defining “patient” and “professional”). Although mental health records are generally confidential, sections 611.004 and 611.0045 provide for access to mental health records by certain individuals. *See* ORD No. 565 (1990). We have marked the information that is subject to section 611.002 of the Health and Safety Code and may only be released in accordance sections 611.004 and 611.0045. If the requestor does not have a right of access to the mental health records we have marked, they must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Next, section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted information relates to an on-going criminal investigation. Based on this representation, we conclude release of the remaining information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publg Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information.

We note, and you acknowledge, that basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.108. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Such basic, front-page information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-8; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, which you state has been released, the OIG may withhold the remaining information at issue under section 552.108(a)(1).

In summary, the OIG may only release the submitted medical and mental health records in accordance with the MPA and chapter 611 of the Health and Safety Code. Except for

basic information, the remaining information at issue may be withheld under section 552.108(a)(1).³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3). If the governmental body does not file suit over this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Reg Hargrove
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RJH/eeg

Ref: ID# 322503

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Dena L. Williams
Law Offices of Chris Garcia
2100 North Main Street, Suite 228
Fort Worth, Texas 76164
(w/o enclosures)