



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 23, 2008

Mr. W. Montgomery Meitler
Assistant Counsel
Texas Education Agency, Office of Legal Services
1701 North Congress Avenue
Austin, Texas 78701-1494

OR2008-13067

Dear Mr. Meitler:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 322450.

The Texas Education Agency ("the TEA") received a request for information relating to an investigation of a named educator. You state that some of the submitted information has been redacted pursuant to the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act ("FERPA"), section 1232g of title 20 of the United States Code.¹ You claim that the rest of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information. We have also considered comments submitted by the requestor. Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

Initially, we must address the TEA's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures that a governmental body must follow in asking this

¹The United States Department of Education Family Policy Compliance Office (the "DOE") has informed this office that FERPA does not permit state and local educational authorities to disclose to this office, without parental consent, unredacted, personally identifiable information contained in education records for the purpose of our review in the open records ruling process under the Act. The DOE has determined that FERPA determinations must be made by the educational authority in possession of the education records. We have posted a copy of the letter from the DOE to this office on the Attorney General's website: <http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/20060725usdoe.pdf>.

office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. Section 552.301(b) requires a governmental body to ask for the attorney general's decision and claim its exceptions to disclosure not later than the tenth business day after the date of its receipt of the written request for information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). The requestor states she sent the instant request by facsimile on July 2, 2008. The copy of the request indicates that the request was received by the TEA on July 2, 2008. Thus, the TEA was required to submit its request for a decision from this office no later than July 17, 2008. However, you did not request a ruling from our office until July 18, 2008. Furthermore, a governmental body that requests an attorney general decision must provide the requestor with a copy of its written communication to the attorney general not later than the tenth business day after receiving the requestor's written request for information. Gov't Code § 552.301(d)(2). The envelope in which you notified the requestor of your request for ruling bears a postmark of July 21, 2008. *See id.* § 552.301(d); .308 (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail). Consequently, we find the TEA failed to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301.

A governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. Of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). A compelling reason exists when third-party interests are at stake or when information is confidential under other law. Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977). Section 552.103 is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision No. 177 (1977); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). In failing to comply with section 552.301, the TEA has waived its claim under section 552.103; therefore, the TEA may not withhold any of the requested information under this exception. However, because sections 552.101 and 552.137 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to overcome this presumption, we will consider whether the submitted information is excepted from disclosure.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't

² The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by statute. Section 552.101 encompasses criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center (“NCIC”) or by the Texas Crime Information Center (“TCIC”). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that state agencies obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from the DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-411.127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Therefore, the TEA must withhold the CHRI that we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code.

~~Section 552.101 also encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Upon review of the submitted information, we conclude that the TEA must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.~~

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). Gov’t Code § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail addresses we have marked are not a type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c) of the Government Code. Therefore, the TEA must withhold the marked e-mail addresses in accordance with section 552.137 unless the owners of the e-mail addresses have consented to their release.

We also note that portions of the submitted information may be protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are protected by copyright. Attorney General Opinion JM-672

(1987). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.* If a member of the public wishes to make copies of materials protected by copyright, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit. *See* Open Records Decision No. 550 (1990).

In summary, the TEA must withhold the information we have marked under (1) section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and common-law privacy, and (2) section 552.137 of the Government Code unless the owners of the e-mail addresses have consented to their release. The remaining information must be released, but any copyrighted information may only be released in accordance with copyright law.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3). If the governmental body does not file suit over this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Chris Schulz", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Chris Schulz
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CS/mcf

Ref: ID# 322450

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Meridith Hayes
Abernathy, Roeder, Boyd & Joplin, P.C.
P.O. Box 1210
McKinney, Texas 75070-1210
(w/o enclosures)