



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 24, 2008

Mr. John R. Marshall
Executive Director
Chief Appraiser
Tarrant Appraisal District
2500 Handley-Ederville Road
Fort Worth, Texas 76118-6909

OR2008-13100

Dear Mr. Marshall:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 322657.

The Tarrant Appraisal District (the "district") received a request for sales information regarding several classes of commercial properties. You indicate you are releasing some information to the requestor. We understand you to assert that some of the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.148 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered your argument and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

¹While you cite House Bill 2188 for your argument to withhold the information at issue, we understand you to raise section 552.148 of the Government Code, as this is the proper exception for the substance of your argument.

²We assume that the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.148 of the Government Code provides in part that “[i]nformation relating to real property sales prices, descriptions, characteristics, and other related information received from a private entity by the comptroller or the chief appraiser of an appraisal district under Chapter 6, Tax Code, is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021.” Gov’t Code § 552.148(a). The legislative history of section 552.148 indicates that it was enacted as a result of the issuance of several open records rulings of this office in which we ruled that information provided by Multiple Listing Services (“MLS”) to appraisal districts under confidentiality agreements is subject to required public disclosure under the Act. *See* HOUSE COMM. ON STATE AFFAIRS, BILL ANALYSIS, Tex. Comm. Substitute H.B. 2188, 80th Leg., R.S. (2007); *see e.g.*, Open Records Letter Nos. 2006-07161 (2006); 2006-04628 (2006). Because of these rulings, many MLS stopped providing sales information to appraisal districts. The bill analysis of House Bill 2188 states that the purpose of section 552.148 is to allow the relationships between MLS and appraisal districts to continue. HOUSE COMM. ON STATE AFFAIRS, BILL ANALYSIS, Tex. Comm. Substitute H.B. 2188, 80th Leg., R.S. (2007). Accordingly, because realtors and private appraisers provide information to MLS, any submitted real property sales information that was obtained from realtors and private appraisers is confidential under section 552.148 of the Government Code. We also find that any submitted real property sales information obtained from an MLS or other similar entity is confidential under section 552.148. To the extent that any submitted information was not obtained from such an entity, it is not confidential under section 552.148 and must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3). If the governmental body does not file suit over this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the

requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Amy L.S. Shipp
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

ALS/jb

Ref: ID# 322657

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Garland M. O'Day, Sr.
Garland O'Day & Associates, Inc.
1037 White Bluff Drive
Whitney, Texas 76692
(w/o enclosures)