



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

September 25, 2008

Mr. Brett Colston
Assistant Chief of Police
Waxahachie Police Department
P.O. Box 338
Waxahachie, Texas 75165

OR2008-13195

Dear Mr. Colston:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 322830.

The Waxahachie Police Department (the "department") received a request for all police reports involving two named individuals. You state that you have released some of the information to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information that is considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."¹ Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the common-law right of privacy. Common-law privacy protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). This office has found that a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. For Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception, such as section 552.101, on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. The present request seeks all police reports involving two-named individuals. We find this request for unspecified law enforcement records, in part, implicates the named individuals' right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting either of the named individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You have submitted report numbers 03-03258 and 08-0150, which do not list the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or defendants. You contend that these reports are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108(a)(2) and 552.108(b)(2), which provides:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

...

(2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication;

...

(b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

...

(2) the internal record or notation relates to law enforcement only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2), (b)(2). Sections 552.108(a)(2) and 552.108(b)(2) protect information that relates to a concluded criminal investigation or prosecution that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *Id.* A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) or section 552.108(b)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than

a conviction or deferred adjudication. *Id.* In this instance, you state that the submitted information relates to “an open and active investigation that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication.” You also state that report number 03-03258 is closed, and report number 08-01750 is active. Because you have provided this office with contradictory representations, we determine that you have failed to demonstrate that the submitted information relates to a concluded investigation or prosecution that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Accordingly, the remaining information may not be withheld under section 552.108(a)(2) or section 552.108(b)(2) of the Government Code.

We note that the remaining information includes additional information protected by common-law privacy. The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *See Indus. Found.* at 683. This office has also found that some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are protected under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps), 545 (1990). Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that “relates to... a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state.” Gov't Code § 552.130. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked under (1) section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, and (2) section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in

² We note that the remaining information contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3). If the governmental body does not file suit over this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Chris Schulz
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CS/ma

Ref: ID# 322830

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Melody Staggs
177 Holder Road
Forreston, Texas 76041
(w/o enclosures)