



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 7, 2008

Mr. C. Patrick Phillips
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street, 3rd Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2008-13732

Dear Mr. Phillips:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 328158.

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for police and fire records involving a named individual or her business. You state you have redacted Texas-issued motor vehicle record information pursuant to the previous determinations issued by this office in Open Records Letter Nos. 2006-14726 (2006) and 2007-00198 (2007). See Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 at 7-8 (2001). You also state you have redacted social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147 of the Government Code.¹ You claim that the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident*

¹Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

Bd., 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U. S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. The present request requires the city to compile unspecified police records concerning a named individual. Therefore, to the extent the city maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note that you have submitted records in which the named individual is not listed as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. Accordingly, we will address your arguments against the disclosure of these records.

Section 552.101 encompasses other statutes, including chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code which authorizes the development of local emergency communications districts. Sections 772.118, 772.218 and 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code are applicable to emergency 911 districts established in accordance with chapter 772. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). These sections make the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 911 callers that are furnished by a 911 service provider confidential. *Id.* at 2. Section 772.118 applies to an emergency communications district for a county with a population of more than two million. Section 772.218 applies to an emergency communications district for a county with a population of more than 860,000. Section 772.318 applies to an emergency communications district for a county with a population of more than 20,000.

You state that the city is part of an emergency communications district established under section 772.218. You explain that the highlighted telephone numbers and addresses contained in the submitted information were furnished by a 911 service provider. Based on your representations, we conclude that the city must withhold the highlighted telephone numbers and addresses in the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.218 of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.*

§§552.108(a)(1), 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that some of the submitted information relates to pending criminal investigations. Based on this representation, we conclude that the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is generally applicable to the submitted information.

We note, however, that section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. 531 S.W.2d 177. *See Open Records Decision No. 127* (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of basic front page information, the city may withhold the information you have marked pursuant to section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure “information [that] relates to... a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state.” Gov't Code § 552.130. Upon review, we agree the city must withhold the information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

You contend that portions of the remaining information are excepted from disclosure under section 552.136 of the Government Code. This section states that “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov't Code § 552.136(b). Upon review, we agree the city must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code states that “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body is confidential and not subject to disclosure under [the Act],” unless the owner of the e-mail address has affirmatively consented to its public disclosure. Gov't Code § 552.317(a)-(b). The types of e-mail addresses listed in section 552.137(c) may not be withheld under this exception. *See id.* § 552.137(c). Likewise, section 552.137 is not applicable to an institutional e-mail address, an Internet website address, or an e-mail address that a governmental entity maintains for one of its officials or employees. The city must withhold the personal e-mail address that you have marked in the remaining information under section 552.137 unless the owner has affirmatively consented to its public disclosure.

In summary, to the extent the city maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold

such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold the highlighted telephone numbers and addresses under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 772.218 of the Health and Safety Code. Except for basic information, which must be released, the city may withhold the information you have marked pursuant to section 552.108 of the Government Code. The city must withhold the information you have marked, and the information we have marked, pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must withhold the information you have marked under sections 552.136 and 552.137 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3). If the governmental body does not file suit over this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or

complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Amy L.S. Shipp
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

ALS/jb

Ref: ID# 328158

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Nina LaFond
A&X Investigations Company
P.O. Box 24126
Fort Worth, Texas 76124
(w/o enclosures)