



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 4, 2008

Ms. Luz E. Sandoval-Walker
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9th Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2008-15082

Dear Ms. Sandoval-Walker:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 330684.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received two requests for information regarding a specified incident. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information that other statutes make confidential. Section 58.007 of the Family Code provides in part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c), (e), (j). Section 58.007(c) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. *See* Act of June 2, 1997, 75th Leg., R.S., ch. 1086, §§ 20, 55(a), 1997 Tex. Gen. Laws 4179, 4187, 4199; Open Records Decision No. 644 (1996). The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2) (defining "child" for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.007(c) is not applicable to information that relates to a juvenile as a complainant, victim, witness, or other involved party and not as a suspect or offender.

The submitted information involves juvenile offenders and therefore falls within the scope of section 58.007(c). In this instance, however, one of the requestors is the mother of one of the juveniles involved. Therefore, the requestor has a right to inspect law enforcement

records concerning her son under section 58.007(e). *See id.* § 58.007(e). However, any personally identifiable information concerning the other juvenile offenders must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(1). For the purposes of section 58.007(j), a juvenile suspect or offender is a child as defined by section 51.02 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 51.02(2) (“child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age). Section 58.007(j) states further that information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must also be redacted. *Id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Accordingly, we will address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information to this requestor, who is the mother of one of the juvenile suspects. However, the department must withhold the submitted incident report in its entirety from the remaining requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code.

The department also asserts that the submitted incident report is excepted under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See Gov’t Code* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You indicate, and provide a representation from the El Paso County Attorney’s office stating, that this report relates to an ongoing criminal investigation. Based on these representations and our review of the submitted documents, we conclude that the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases).

Section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” *Gov’t Code* § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic front-page information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. The department must release basic information, including a detailed description of the offense and arrest information to the second requestor, who is the mother of one of the listed juvenile suspects, even if this information does not literally appear on the front page of an offense or arrest report. *See Houston Chronicle*, 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Any information, however, that identifies or tends to identify a juvenile suspect, offender other than this requestor’s child may not be released as basic information. *See Fam. Code* § 58.007(j)(1).

In summary, with regard to the requestor who is the mother of one of the listed juvenile suspects, except for basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the submitted report under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In releasing the basic information to this requestor, the department must redact any information that identifies

or tends to identify a juvenile suspect or offender other than the requestor's child. With regard to the remaining requestor, the department must withhold the submitted report in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3). If the governmental body does not file suit over this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for

contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Amy Shipp".

Amy L.S. Shipp
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

ALS/jb

Ref: ID# 330684

Enc. Submitted documents