



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

November 4, 2008

Mr. Gregory Alicie  
Open Records Specialist  
Baytown Police Department  
3200 North Main Street  
Baytown, Texas 77521

OR2008-15085

Dear Mr. Alicie:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 330219.

The Baytown Police Department (the "department") received two requests for information regarding a specified incident. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the submitted information relates to a pending criminal case. Based on this representation, we conclude that the release of the information highlighted in orange would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases).

Therefore, the department may withhold the orange-highlighted information under section 552.108(a)(1).

You claim that the information you have highlighted in pink is excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code. This section excepts from disclosure information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit or a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state. See Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). Because section 552.130 protects privacy, which is a personal right that lapses at death, Texas motor vehicle record information pertaining to a deceased individual may not be withheld under this exception. See *Moore*, 589 S.W.2d at 491; see also Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981) (privacy rights lapse upon death). Accordingly, to the extent the Texas motor vehicle record information you have highlighted in pink in the remaining information pertains to a vehicle owned by a living person, it must be withheld under section 552.130; however, this information may not be withheld under section 552.130 if it pertains to a deceased individual.

Finally, you claim that the social security numbers you have highlighted in green are excepted from disclosure under section 552.147 of the Government Code. This section provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. Therefore, the department may withhold the green-highlighted social security numbers under section 552.147.<sup>1</sup>

In summary, the department may withhold the orange-highlighted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and the green-highlighted social security numbers under section 552.147 of the Government Code. To the extent the pink-highlighted information in the remaining information pertains to a vehicle owned by a living person, it must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to the requestors.<sup>2</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in

---

<sup>1</sup>We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

<sup>2</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address your remaining argument against disclosure.

Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3). If the governmental body does not file suit over this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it; then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Amy L.S. Shipp  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

ALS/jb

Ref: ID# 330219

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Shanan Biddle  
13733 Duncum Street, #1  
Houston, Texas 77015  
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Misti R. Cartwright  
15603 Market Street  
Houston, Texas 77530  
(w/o enclosures)