



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 8, 2008

Ms. Catrina Purcell Longoria
Langley & Banack
401 Quarry Street
Eagle Pass, Texas 78852

OR2008-16691

Dear Ms. Longoria:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 329461.

The Eagle Pass Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a particular accident, including any and all accident records, 911 recordings, incident reports, supplements, witness statements, photographs, drawings, and autopsy reports. You state the department does not have information responsive to a portion of the request. We note that the Act does not require a governmental body to disclose information that did not exist at the time the request was received or to create responsive information. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.— San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 555 at 1 (1990), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983). You state you have released some of the requested information. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.*

§§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108(a). However, you have failed to explain how the release of the submitted information would interfere with a particular pending criminal investigation or prosecution. Additionally, you have not explained how the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement or crime prevention. Therefore, you have failed to demonstrate how section 552.108 is applicable to the submitted information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 252 at 3 (1980). Accordingly, we conclude that the department may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."¹ Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101, encompasses information made confidential by other statutes such as section 550.065 of the Transportation Code. We note that the submitted information includes a CRB-3 accident report form completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, a governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *Id.* Here, the requestor has not provided the department with two of the required pieces of information for the submitted accident report form. Thus, the department must withhold the marked CRB-3 accident report under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code.

The submitted information contains fingerprint information. Section 552.101 also encompasses chapter 560 of the Government Code, which governs the public availability of fingerprints. Section 560.001 defines "biometric identifier," for the purposes of chapter 560, as meaning "a retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry." Gov't Code § 560.001(1). Section 560.002 provides that a governmental body that possesses a biometric identifier of an individual:

(1) may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose the biometric identifier to another person unless:

(a) the individual consents to the disclosure;

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

(b) the disclosure is required or permitted by a federal statute or by a state statute other than [the Act]; or

(c) the disclosure is made by or to a law enforcement agency for a law enforcement purpose; and

(2) shall store, transmit, and protect from disclosure the biometric identifier using reasonable care and in a manner that is the same as or more protective than the manner in which the governmental body stores, transmits, and protects its other confidential information.

Id. § 560.002. Section 560.003 provides “[a] biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under [the Act].” *Id.* § 560.003. As there is no indication the requestor in this instance has a right of access under section 560.002 to the submitted fingerprint information, this information is confidential under section 560.003 and must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses chapter 411 of the Government Code. Criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See Gov’t Code* § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* ORD 565. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. The submitted information contains CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Accordingly, this information, which we have marked, is excepted from required public disclosure by section 552.101 of the Government Code.

The submitted information also includes medical records that are subject to the Medical Practice Act (the “MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which is also

encompassed by section 552.101. *See* Occ. Code § 151.001. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002(b)-(c). This office has concluded that the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). This office has concluded that when a file is created as the result of a hospital stay, all of the documents in the file that relate to diagnosis and treatment constitute either physician-patient communications or records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that are created or maintained by a physician. *See* Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990).

Medical records must be released on signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *See id.* §§ 159.004. When a patient is deceased, as is the case here, medical records pertaining to the deceased patient may only be released upon the signed consent of the deceased's personal representative. *See id.* § 59.005(a)(5). Any subsequent release of medical records must be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. *See id.* § 159.002(c); Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). We have marked the medical records that are confidential under the MPA. This information may only be released in accordance with the MPA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991).

The submitted information also includes emergency medical service ("EMS") records that are subject to chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code, which is also encompassed by section 552.101. Access to EMS records is governed by the provisions of section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Section 773.091 provides in part the following:

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or

maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

...

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services.

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(b), (g). Thus, except for the information specified in section 773.091(g), EMS records are deemed confidential under section 773.091 and, therefore, may only be released in accordance with chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code. *See id.* §§ 773.091-.094. We have marked the information that constitutes EMS records pursuant to section 773.091. We note, however, that records that are confidential under section 773.091 may be disclosed to “any person who bears a written consent of the patient or other persons authorized to act on the patient’s behalf for the release of confidential information.” *Id.* §§ 773.092(e)(4), .093. Among the individuals authorized to act on the patient’s behalf in providing written consent is a “personal representative” if the patient is deceased. *Id.* Section 773.093 provides that a consent for release of EMS records must specify: (1) the information or records to be covered by the release; (2) the reasons or purpose for the release; and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *Id.* § 773.093(a). Thus, the department must withhold the EMS records we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, except as specified by section 773.091(g). However, the department must release these EMS records on receipt of proper consent under section 773.093(a). *See id.* §§ 773.092, .093; ORD 632.

We note that portions of the remaining information are subject to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Section 552.101 encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. In addition, this office has found that medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Accordingly, the department must withhold

the information that we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Next, we note that a portion of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). We have marked Texas driver's license and motor vehicle record information that the department must withhold under section 552.130.

Finally, we note that the remaining information contains an e-mail address subject to section 552.137 of the Government Code. This section excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body," unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection(c). Gov't Code § 552.137(a)-(c). We have marked the e-mail address that is not of a type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). You do not inform us that this individual has consented to the release of his e-mail address. Therefore, the department must withhold the e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold: (1) the marked CRB-3 accident report under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code; (2) the submitted fingerprints under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code; (3) the marked CHRI under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code; (4) the medical records we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with the MPA; (5) the EMS records we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code; (6) the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy; (7) the Texas driver's license and motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130; and (8) the e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the

²We note that the information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3). If the governmental body does not file suit over this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Lauren E. Kleine
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LEK/eeg

Ref: ID# 329461

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)