



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

December 17, 2008

Ms. Lillian Guillen Graham  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Mesquite  
P.O. Box 850137  
Mesquite, Texas 75185-0137

OR2008-17141

Dear Ms. Graham:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 331075.

The Mesquite Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified arrest report pertaining to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted report.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007. *See* Fam. Code § 51.03(a), (b). For purposes of section 58.007, "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See id.* § 51.02(2). The relevant language of section 58.007 reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law.

*Id.* § 58.007(c), (e), (j). Upon review of the submitted report, we agree that it involves an allegation of juvenile conduct in violation of a penal statute that occurred after September 1, 1997. Thus, the submitted report is subject to section 58.007. However, as you acknowledge, the requestor is the juvenile offender involved in the submitted report. Under section 58.007(e), the requestor has a right to inspect or copy law enforcement records concerning herself. *See id.* § 58.007(e). Section 58.007(j)(2), however, provides that information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must also be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Thus, because you have marked portions of the submitted report under sections 552.130 and 552.147 of the Government Code, we will address whether the marked information is excepted under those sections. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2).

You have marked the driver's licenses of the other individuals involved in the submitted report under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license or driver's license issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1). The department must withhold the Texas driver's license numbers you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

You have also marked the social security numbers of the other individuals involved in the submitted report under section 552.147 of the Government Code. Section 552.147 provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. *Id.* § 552.147. The department may withhold the social security numbers you have marked in the submitted report pursuant to section 552.147.

We note that a portion of the remaining information is confidential under common-law privacy. Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U. S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Therefore, the department must withhold the criminal history information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The department must also withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The remaining information must be released to the requestor in accordance with section 58.007(e) of the Family Code.<sup>1</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in

---

<sup>1</sup>We note that the requestor has a special right of access to some of the information being released in this instance. Gov't Code § 552.023 (person or person's authorized representative has a special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests). Because such information may be confidential with respect to the general public, if the department receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office.

Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3). If the governmental body does not file suit over this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Laura E. Ream  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

LER/jb

Ref: ID# 331075

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)