



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 30, 2008

Mr. J. David Dodd, III
Nichols, Jackson, Dillard, Hager & Smith, L.L.P.
1800 Lincoln Plaza
500 North Akard
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2008-17618

Dear Mr. Dodd:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 331120.

The Allen Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for a specified incident report. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that the department did not comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting this decision. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), the governmental body must ask for the attorney general's decision and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(a), (b). You state that the department received the request on September 30, 2008. However, you did not request a ruling from our office or submit the information at issue until October 15, 2008. Consequently, we find that the department failed to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the information is public and must be released. Information that is presumed public must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *See Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Generally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records

Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Because the department has failed to comply with the procedural requirements of the Act, the department has waived sections 552.103 and 552.108. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally); 663 at 5 (1999) (untimely request for decision resulted in waiver of discretionary exceptions); 177 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). However, because section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to withhold information, we will address the applicability of this exception.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information that is considered to be confidential by law. You state that the submitted information is confidential under the Texas Family Code and the Texas Government Code. However, you have failed to direct our attention to any statute, and this office is not otherwise aware of any statute, that makes the submitted information confidential in its entirety for purposes of section 552.101.

We note, however, that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under common-law privacy. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. In addition, this office has found that medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Upon review, we conclude that the department must generally withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note that the requestor is an attorney. We do not know, however, whether or not the requestor represents the individual at issue. If the requestor is the authorized representative of the individual at issue, then the requestor has a right of access pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code to the information at issue, and the department must release this information to her. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person or person’s representative to whom information relates on grounds that information is considered confidential under privacy principles). If the requestor does not have a right of access to the submitted information pursuant to section 552.023, then the department must

withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Next, we note that a portion of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code, which provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release.¹ *Id.* § 552.130(a)(1), (2). We have marked Texas driver's license information that must be withheld under section 552.130. We note that to the extent the requestor has a right of access under section 552.023 to the named individual's private information, it may not be withheld under section 552.130. *See id.* § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself).

In summary, to the extent the requestor does not have a special right of access to the information we have marked, it must be withheld pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3). If the governmental body does not file suit over this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception like section 552.130 of the Government Code on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

²We note the remaining information contains a social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147. However, if the requestor is the authorized representative of this individual, she has a right of access to the individual's social security number and it must be released to her. *See generally id.* § 552.023(b).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Greg Henderson
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

GH/jb

Ref: ID# 331120

Enc. Submitted documents