



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

March 27, 2009

Ms. J. Middlebrooks  
Assistant City Attorney  
Criminal Law and Police Section  
City of Dallas  
1400 South Lamar  
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2009-04038

Dear Ms. Middlebrooks:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 338239 (DPD # 09-0142, # 09-0143, # 09-0144, # 09-0179, # 09-0214, # 09-0216).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received six requests for information regarding the shooting of a department police officer. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.117, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

Initially, we note that the submitted information contains a document filed with a court that is expressly public under section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. Such information must be released unless it is expressly confidential under other law. You claim that the court order at issue is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume that the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

However, section 552.108 is a discretionary exception that protects a governmental body's interests and is therefore not "other law" for purposes of section 552.022(a)(17). *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 586 (1991) (governmental body may waive section 552.108). Therefore, the department may not withhold the court-filed document under section 552.108. As you raise no other exception to disclosure of this information, the court-filed document, which we have marked, must be released to the requestor.

Section 552.108(a) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the submitted information relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based upon this representation and our review, we conclude that the release of the submitted information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Accordingly, we agree that the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Accordingly, you must withhold the CHRI we have marked

under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *C.f. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Upon review, we agree that the department must withhold the criminal history information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

This office has also found that common-law privacy applies to the identifying information of juvenile offenders. *See* Open Records Decision No. 384 (1983); *cf.* Fam. Code § 58.007. Thus, the department must withhold the identifying information of the juvenile offender that you have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code states that "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.136. We note, however, that the purpose of section 552.136 is to protect the privacy interests of individuals, and because the right of privacy lapses at death, the account numbers of a deceased individual may not be withheld under section 552.136. *See Moore*, 589 S.W.2d at 491. The account information you have marked under section 552.136 pertains to a deceased individual. Therefore, it is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.136 and must be released.

In summary, with the exception of the court order which must be released under 552.022(a)(17), you may withhold the information you have marked under 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. You must withhold the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code. You also must withhold criminal history information and identifying information of the juvenile offender marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

Sincerely,



Sarah Casterline  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

SEC/sdk

Ref: ID# 338239

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 5 Requestors  
(w/o enclosures)