



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

April 17, 2009

Mr. Samuel D. Hawk
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar Street
Dallas, Texas 75215-1815

OR2009-05115

Dear Mr. Hawk:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 340207 (DPD# 2009-0800).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for all records pertaining to two named individuals. You state you have released some of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note you have only submitted information concerning one of the named individuals. Therefore, to the extent responsive information concerning the other individual exists we assume it has been released. If such information has not been released, then it must be released at this time. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301(a), . 302; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (if governmental body concludes that no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U. S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy

interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. We agree the present request requires the department to compile unspecified criminal history records concerning the individual named in the request, and thus, implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note you have submitted reports that do not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. Because this information is not part of a compilation of an individual's criminal history, the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that basis. Common-law privacy also protects the types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. See *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 683. In Open Records Decision No. 393 (1983), this office concluded, generally, only that information which either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense may be withheld under common-law privacy; however, because the identifying information was inextricably intertwined with other releasable information, the governmental body was required to withhold the entire report. Open Records Decision No. 393 at 2 (1983); see Open Records Decision No. 339 (1982); see also *Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519 (Tex. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (identity of witnesses to and victims of sexual harassment was highly intimate or embarrassing information and public did not have a legitimate interest in such information); Open Records Decision No. 440 (1986) (detailed descriptions of serious sexual offenses must be withheld). The requestor in this case knows the identity of the alleged sexual assault victim. Thus, we believe, in this instance, withholding only identifying information from the requestor would not preserve the victim's common law right to privacy. We conclude, therefore, the department must withhold report number 0308693-E in its entirety pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release.¹ Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). Therefore, the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle information we have marked under section 552.130.

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception like section 552.130 of the Government Code on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold report number 0308693-E in its entirety pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle information we have marked under section 552.130. The remaining information must be released.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

Sincerely,



Olivia A. Maceo
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

OM/eeg

Ref: ID# 340207

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

²We note the submitted information contains a social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a government body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.