



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 5, 2009

Ms. P. Armstrong
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law and Police Section
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2009-05966

Dear Ms. Armstrong:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 346505 (ORR 2009-2696).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for report number 76782-W. You claim that portions of the requested information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. The submitted information

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

includes a CRB-3 accident report form completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (Texas Peace Officer's Accident Report form). Section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code states that except as provided by subsection (c), accident reports are privileged and confidential. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. Transp. Code § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Texas Department of Transportation or another governmental body is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the governmental body with two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In the present request, the requestor has not provided the required information. Accordingly, the department must withhold the submitted accident report form from public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both elements of the test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Although a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public, in this instance there is a legitimate public interest in prior DWI arrest information in the context of the submitted DWI arrest report. Therefore, the information you have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy is not confidential under section 552.101 and must be released.

You assert that some of the remaining information is excepted under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You have marked the information that the department seeks to withhold under section 552.108. You state that the marked information relates to pending criminal investigations or prosecutions. Based on this representation, we conclude that the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531

S.W.2d 177 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Thus, we agree the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1). We note that you have the discretion to release all or part of this information that is not otherwise confidential by law. Gov't Code § 552.007.

You assert that some of the remaining information is excepted under section 552.130 of the Government Code, which provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release. *Id.* § 552.130(a)(1), (2). We note that some of the information you have marked does not consist of Texas motor vehicle record information; we have marked this information for release. Except for the information marked for release, the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked and the additional information we have marked under section 552.130.

You claim that some of the remaining information is excepted under section 552.147 of the Government Code, which provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147. The department may withhold the social security numbers you have marked under section 552.147.²

To conclude, the department must withhold the submitted accident report under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065 of the Transportation Code. The department must also withhold the information marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108 of the Government Code, and social security numbers under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public

²We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 346505

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)