



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

June 26, 2009

Ms. J. Middlebrooks  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Dallas  
1400 South Lamar  
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2009-08835

Dear Ms. Middlebrooks:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 347324 (DPD No. 09-2928).

The City of Dallas (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to a specified internal affairs investigation. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

Initially, we note that a portion of the requested information was the subject of a previous request for information, in response to which this office issued Open Records Letter No. 2009-06367 (2009). In that ruling, we found that the city may withhold the information at issue under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. With regard to the requested information that is identical to the information previously submitted and ruled upon by this office in the prior ruling, we conclude that, as we have no indication that the law, facts, or circumstances on which the prior ruling was based have changed, the city may continue to

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume that the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

rely upon Open Records Letter No. 2009-06367 as a previous determination and withhold or release the identical information in accordance with that ruling. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (so long as law, facts, circumstances, on which prior ruling was based have not changed, first type of previous determination exists where requested information is precisely same information as was addressed in prior attorney general ruling, ruling is addressed to same governmental body, and ruling concludes that information is or is not excepted from disclosure). We will address your arguments regarding the submitted information, which has not been previously ruled upon.

Next we note, and you acknowledge, that the city failed to comply with its deadline under section 552.301(e) of the Government Code in requesting this decision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e). The submitted information is therefore presumed to be public and must be released, unless there is a compelling reason to withhold any of the information. *See id.* § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ). This statutory presumption can generally be overcome when information is confidential by law or third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 630 at 3 (1994), 325 at 2 (1982). You raise section 552.108 of the Government Code, which is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.108 subject to waiver). Nevertheless, the interests under section 552.108 of a governmental body other than the one that failed to comply with section 552.301 can provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure under section 552.302. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 at 2-3 (1991). You inform us that the Collin County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney") asserts a law enforcement interest in the information at issue. Therefore, we will determine whether the city may withhold the information on behalf of the district attorney under section 552.108.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). We note the marked information is related to an internal affairs investigation. Section 552.108 is generally not applicable to records of an administrative investigation that did not result in a criminal investigation or prosecution. *See Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519, 525-26 (Tex. Civ. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (addressing statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.108). However, you state the submitted information pertains to a pending criminal prosecution. You also inform us the district attorney states the release of this information could jeopardize the pending prosecution. Based on your representations and our review, we

conclude the release of the information you have marked would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (per curiam) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Accordingly, we agree the city may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, the city may continue to rely upon Open Records Letter No. 2009-06367 as a previous determination and withhold or release the information at issue in the prior request in accordance with that ruling. The city may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

Sincerely,



Matt Entsminger  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

MRE/dls

Ref: ID# 347324

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)