



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

July 1, 2009

Ms. Angela H. Robinson
Law, Snakard & Gambill, P.C.
1600 West Seventh Street, Suite 500
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2009-09111

Dear Ms. Robinson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 352217.

The Tarrant County College District (the "college"), which you represent, received a request for several categories of information pertaining to "trustee email rerouting". You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.107 of the Government Code privileged under rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence. We have your arguments and reviewed the submitted information.¹

We note Exhibit 2 is subject to section 552.022(a)(16) of the Government Code. This section provides in part:

(a) the following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure under this chapter unless they are expressly confidential under other law:

(16) information that is in a bill for attorney's fees and that is not privileged under the attorney-client privilege[.]

Gov't Code. § 552.022(a)(16). In this instance, the Exhibit 2 consists of an attorney fee bill. Thus, the college must release this information pursuant to section 552.022(a)(16) unless it

¹To the extent any additional information responsive to this request existed on the date the college received the request, we assume you have released it. If you have not released any such information to the requestor, you must do so at this time. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301(a), 302; see also Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (if governmental body concludes that no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible).

is expressly confidential under other law. Section 552.107 of the Government Code is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Open Records Decision No. 676 at 10-11 (2002) (attorney-client privilege under section 552.107(1) may be waived); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 522 (1989) (discretionary exceptions in general). As such, section 552.107 is not other law that makes information confidential for the purposes of section 552.022. Therefore, the college may not withhold the submitted fee bills under section 552.107 of the Government Code. However, the Texas Supreme Court has held the Texas Rules of Evidence are "other law" within the meaning of section 552.022 of the Government Code. *See In re City of Georgetown*, 53 S.W.3d 328, 336 (Tex. 2001). Therefore, we will consider your argument under rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence for Exhibit 2.

Rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence encompasses the attorney-client privilege and provides:

A client has a privilege to refuse to disclose and to prevent any other person from disclosing confidential communications made for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services to the client:

- (A) between the client or a representative of the client and the client's lawyer or a representative of the lawyer;
- (B) between the lawyer and the lawyer's representative;
- (C) by the client or a representative of the client, or the client's lawyer or a representative of the lawyer, to a lawyer or a representative of a lawyer representing another party in a pending action and concerning a matter of common interest therein;
- (D) between representatives of the client or between the client and a representative of the client; or
- (E) among lawyers and their representatives representing the same client.

TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). A communication is "confidential" if not intended to be disclosed to third persons other than those to whom disclosure is made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the client or those reasonably necessary for the transmission of the communication. *Id.* 503(a)(5). Thus, in order to withhold attorney-client privileged information from disclosure under rule 503, a governmental body must: (1) show that the document is a communication transmitted between privileged parties or reveals a confidential communication; (2) identify the parties involved in the communication; and (3) show that the communication is confidential by explaining that it was not intended to be disclosed to third persons and that it was made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal

services to the client. Upon a demonstration of all three factors, the information is privileged and confidential under rule 503, provided the client has not waived the privilege or the document does not fall within the purview of the exceptions to the privilege enumerated in rule 503(d). *Pittsburgh Corning Corp. v. Caldwell*, 861 S.W.2d 423, 427 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1993, no writ).

You represent portions of the submitted fee bills consist of confidential communications between the college's outside legal counsel and the college made for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services to the college. You also state this information was not intended to be disclosed to third parties. Upon review, we conclude Exhibit 2 does not consist of or reveal confidential attorney-client communications. Thus, you have failed to demonstrate any of the information at issue documents privileged attorney-client communications. Accordingly, Exhibit 2 may not be withheld under Texas Rule of Evidence 503.

Section 552.107(1) of the Government Code protects information that comes within the attorney-client privilege. When asserting the attorney-client privilege, a governmental body has the burden of providing the necessary facts to demonstrate the elements of the privilege in order to withhold the information at issue. Open Records Decision No. 676 at 6-7 (2002).

First, a governmental body must demonstrate that the information constitutes or documents a communication. *Id.* at 7. Second, the communication must have been made "for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services" to the client governmental body. TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). The privilege does not apply when an attorney or representative is involved in some capacity other than that of providing or facilitating professional legal services to the client governmental body. *In re Texas Farmers Ins. Exch.*, 990 S.W.2d 337, 340 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1999, orig. proceeding) (attorney-client privilege does not apply if attorney acting in a capacity other than that of attorney). Third, the privilege applies only to communications between or among clients, client representatives, lawyers, and lawyer representatives. *See* TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). Thus, a governmental body must inform this office of the identities and capacities of the individuals to whom each communication at issue has been made. Lastly, the attorney-client privilege applies only to a confidential communication, meaning it was "not intended to be disclosed to third persons other than those to whom disclosure is made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the client or those reasonably necessary for the transmission of the communication." *Id.* 503(a)(5). Whether a communication meets this definition depends on the intent of the parties involved at the time the information was communicated. *Osborne v. Johnson*, 954 S.W.2d 180, 184 (Tex. App.—Waco 1997, no writ). Moreover, because the client may elect to waive the privilege at any time, a governmental body must explain that the confidentiality of a communication has been maintained. We note that section 552.107(1) generally excepts an entire communication that is demonstrated to be protected by the attorney-client privilege unless otherwise waived by the governmental body. *See Huie v. DeShazo*, 922 S.W.2d 920, 923 (Tex. 1996) (privilege extends to entire communication, including facts contained therein).

You state that Exhibit 4 consists of confidential communications between college employees and a college attorney. You further assert the communications were made for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services to the college, and the confidentiality of the communications have been maintained. Based on your representations and our review of the information at issue, we agree that Exhibit 4 constitutes privileged attorney-client communications. Accordingly, the college may withhold this information under section 552.107 of the Government Code.

In summary, the college may withhold Exhibit 4 under section 552.107. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

Sincerely,



Paige Savoie
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PS/eeg

Ref: ID# 352217

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)