



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 12, 2009

Ms. P. Armstrong
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law and Police Division
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2009-11266

Dear Ms. Armstrong:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 351770.

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for the police report, photographs, and video footage of a specific homicide investigation. You claim that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, you acknowledge, and we agree, the department failed to timely request an open records decision from this office as prescribed by section 552.301 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b), (e). A governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body

¹ We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Normally, a compelling interest is demonstrated when some other source of law makes the information at issue confidential or third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Section 552.108 is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 663 at 5 (1999) (untimely request for decision resulted in waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). However, the need of another governmental body to withhold information under section 552.108 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason under section 552.302. Open Records Decision No. 586 (1991). Because you inform us the Dallas County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney") objects to the release of the requested information, we will consider your claim regarding section 552.108. Sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code also constitute compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness. Therefore, we will address your arguments under these exceptions as well.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information protected by chapter 411 of the Government Code, which deems confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." Gov't Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* at 10-12. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Texas Department of Public Safety (the "DPS") maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from the DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* § 411.090-.127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from the DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Upon review, we find a portion of the submitted information constitutes CHRI generated by the FBI. The

department must withhold this information, which we have marked, pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.²

Section 552.108(a) excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the district attorney requests the information at issue be withheld because release of this information at this time will hinder its ability to prosecute this case. Based upon this representation and our review, we conclude release of the information you have marked under section 552.108 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Therefore, the department may withhold the marked information under section 552.108(a)(1).

You claim some of the remaining information is excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure “information [that] relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state [.]” Gov’t Code § 552.130. Therefore, the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130.

In summary, the department must withhold the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083. The department may withhold the information it has marked under section 552.108(a)(1). The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information it has marked under section 552.130. The remaining information must be released.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

² As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your argument against disclosure of this information.

³ We note that the information being released contains a living person’s social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. By its terms, this section does not apply to the social security number of a deceased individual. Therefore, the department may not withhold the social security number it has marked belonging to the deceased individual under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

Sincerely,



Mack T. Harrison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MTH/sdk

Ref: ID# 351770

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)