



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 23, 2009

Ms. Neera Chatterjee
Office of the General Counsel
The University of Texas System
201 West Seventh Street
Austin, Texas 78701-2902

OR2009-13416

Dear Ms. Chatterjee:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 356478.

The University of Texas at San Antonio (the "university") received a request for all documents related to the investigation and resignation of a former university employee. You state you will provide the requestor with a portion of the requested information. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

¹We assume that the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that: (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Information pertaining to the work conduct and job performance of public employees is subject to a legitimate public interest and is, therefore, generally not protected from disclosure under common-law privacy. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 470* (1987) (public employee's job performance does not generally constitute employee's private affairs), 455 (1987) (public employee's job performance or abilities generally not protected by privacy), 444 (1986) (public has legitimate interest in knowing reasons for dismissal, demotion, promotion, or resignation of public employee), 423 at 2 (1984) (scope of public employee privacy is narrow).

In *Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519 (Tex. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied), the court addressed the applicability of common-law privacy to information relating to an investigation of alleged sexual harassment. The investigation files in *Ellen* contained individual witness statements, an affidavit by the individual accused of the misconduct responding to the allegations, and conclusions of the board of inquiry that conducted the investigation. *See* 840 S.W.2d at 525. The court ordered the release of the affidavit of the person under investigation and the conclusions of the board of inquiry, stating that the public's interest was sufficiently served by the disclosure of such documents. *Id.* The *Ellen* court held that "the public did not possess a legitimate interest in the identities of the individual witnesses, nor the details of their personal statements beyond what is contained in the documents that have been ordered released." *Id.*

Thus, if there is an adequate summary of an investigation of sexual harassment, the summary must be released along with the statement of the person accused of sexual harassment, but the identities of the victims and witnesses must be redacted and their detailed statements must be withheld from disclosure. If no adequate summary of the investigation exists, then detailed statements regarding the allegations must be released, but the identities of victims and witnesses must be redacted from the statements. In either event, the identity of the individual accused of sexual harassment is not protected from public disclosure. We note that supervisors are generally not witnesses for purposes of *Ellen*, except where their statements appear in a non-supervisory context.

The submitted information contains an adequate summary of a sexual harassment investigation. The summary, which you state is being released, is not confidential under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Therefore, pursuant to section 552.101 and the ruling in *Ellen*, the summary must be released, but the remaining information related to the investigation must be withheld.

Common-law privacy also protects other types of information. This office has found that personal financial information not related to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is intimate and embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history protected under common-law privacy), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). Upon review, we conclude that the information you have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Accordingly, the university must withhold the additional information marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.²

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body,” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). Gov’t Code § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail address you have marked in the remaining information is not specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). *See* Act of May 15, 2001, 77th Leg., R.S., ch. 356, § 1, 2001 Tex. Gen. Laws 651, 651–52, *amended by* Act of May 27, 2009, 81st Leg., R.S., ch. 962, § 7, 2009 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 2555, 2557 (Vernon) (to be codified as an amendment to Gov’t Code § 552.137(c)). The university states it has not received consent to release the e-mail address. Therefore, the university must withhold the e-mail address you have marked in accordance with section 552.137.

In summary, the university must withhold the information related to the sexual harassment investigation you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and the holding in *Ellen*. The university must also withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The university must withhold the e-mail address you have marked under section 552.137. The remaining information must be released,

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Sarah Casterline", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Sarah Casterline
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SEC/jb

Ref: ID# 356478

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)