



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 23, 2009

Ms. Nicole B. Webster
Assistant City Attorney
City of Waco, Legal Services
P.O. Box 2570
Waco, Texas 76702-2570

OR2009-13420

Dear Ms. Webster:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 356154 (City of Waco Reference LGL-09-701).

The City of Waco (the "city") received a request for information relating to the requestor's application for employment with the city. You indicate the city does not have information responsive to a portion of the request.¹ You also indicate you will release portions of the responsive information. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. You also state portions of the submitted information may contain confidential and proprietary information subject to exception under the Act. Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, the city notified Profiles International ("Profiles") of the request for information and of its right to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received any comments from Profiles explaining why Exhibit 4 should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude that Profiles has a protected proprietary interest in Exhibit 4. *See id.* § 552.110;

¹We note the Act does not require a governmental body to release information that did not exist when it received a request or create responsive information. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 555 at 1 (1990), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3. Accordingly, the city may not withhold Exhibit 4 based upon the proprietary interests of the third party.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential. *Id.* § 411.083(a); Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. ORD 565. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to the CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Upon review, we find a portion of Exhibit 3 is CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Accordingly, you must withhold the CHRI we have marked in Exhibit 3 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code.² However, you have not demonstrated the remaining information you marked constitutes CHRI for the purposes of section 411.083. Accordingly, no portion of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

You note Exhibit 4 is protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Attorney General Opinion JM-672 (1987). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.* If a member of the public wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit. *See* Open Records Decision No. 550 (1990).

²We note the requestor can obtain his own CHRI from DPS. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083(b)(3).

In summary, the information we have marked in Exhibit 3 must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released, but any information protected by copyright may only be released in accordance with copyright law.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Karen E. Stack
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KES/jb

Ref: ID# 356154

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

³We note the requestor has a special right of access to some of the information being released in this instance. Gov't Code § 552.023 (person or person's authorized representative has a special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests). Because such information may be confidential with respect to the general public, if the city receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the city must again seek a ruling from this office.