



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

December 3, 2009

Mr. Scott A. Durfee  
Assistant General Counsel  
Harris County District Attorney  
1201 Franklin, Suite 600  
Houston, Texas 77002-1901

OR2009-17112

Dear Mr. Durfee:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 363084.

The Harris County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney") received two requests from the same requestor for any and all records related to the post conviction review of a named individual and the possible indictment of two named individuals. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

Initially, we note the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022 provides in relevant part:

(a) Without limiting the amount or kind of information that is public information under this chapter, the following categories of information are public information and

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

not excepted from required disclosure under this chapter unless they are expressly confidential under other law:

- (1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). The requested information constitutes part of a completed investigation. Section 552.022(a)(1) makes this information expressly public unless it is confidential under other law or excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Although you seek to withhold this information under section 552.103 of the Government Code, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 439, 475-6 (Tex. App.—Dallas, 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). As such, section 552.103 is not other law that makes information confidential for the purposes of section 552.022. Therefore, the district attorney may not withhold the requested information under section 552.103. However, because information subject to section 552.022(a)(1) may be withheld under sections 552.101 and 552.108, we will address these claims.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides in part:

- (a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

...

- (4) it is information that:

- (A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

- (B) represents the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(4). A governmental body must reasonably explain how and why section 552.108 is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). In *Curry v. Walker*, 873 S.W.2d 379 (Tex. 1994), the Texas Supreme Court held that a request for a district attorney's "entire litigation file" was "too broad" and, quoting *National Union Fire Insurance Co. v. Valdez*, 863 S.W.2d 458 (Tex. 1993, orig. proceeding), held that "the decision as to what to include in [the file]

necessarily reveals the attorney's thought processes concerning the prosecution or defense of the case." *Curry*, 873 S.W.2d at 380. The present request is for "any and all" documents relating to a post conviction review of a named individual and possible indictment of two named individuals. You contend that the instant request encompasses the entire prosecution file. You assert that release of the requested information would reveal the mental impressions or legal reasoning of prosecutors in the district attorney's office. Based on your representation, we conclude that section 552.108(a)(4) is applicable to the submitted information.

We note, however, that section 552.108 does not except from disclosure "basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to basic "front-page" information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Company v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. App.—Houston [14<sup>th</sup> Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). See Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the district attorney may withhold the requested information under section 552.108(a)(4) of the Government Code and the court's ruling in *Curry*.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrines of constitutional privacy and common-law privacy. Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. Open Records Decision No. 455 at 4 (1987). The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy," which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than under the common-law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the "most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (citing *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5<sup>th</sup> Cir. 1985)).

Common-law privacy protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Upon review, we conclude you have failed to demonstrate how any of the basic information is highly intimate or embarrassing information of no legitimate public interest. Thus, the district attorney may not withhold any of the basic information under

section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Further, the district attorney has failed to demonstrate how any portion of the basic information falls within the zones of privacy or implicates an individual's privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Thus, none of the basic information may be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

In summary, with the exception of basic information that must be released, the district attorney may withhold the requested information under section 552.108(a)(4) of the Government Code and the court's ruling in *Curry*.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Andrea L. Caldwell  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

ALC/eeg

Ref: ID# 363084

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)