



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

December 3, 2009

Ms. Kristy Ashberry  
City Secretary  
City of Rockwall  
385 South Goliad  
Rockwall, Texas 75087

OR2009-17122

Dear Ms. Ashberry:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 363205.

The Rockwall Police Department (the "department") received a request for the incident report pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the submitted incident report is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted incident report involves, among other things, an alleged violation of section 32.51 of the Penal Code, which provides that "[a] person commits an offense if the person, with the intent to harm or defraud another, obtains, possesses, transfers, or uses an item of . . . identifying information of another person without the other person's consent[.]" Penal Code § 32.51(b)(1). For purposes of section 32.51, "identifying information" includes an individual's name and financial institution account number. *Id.* § 32.51(a)(1)(A), (C). Article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure pertains to alleged violations of section 32.51 that occurred on or after September 1, 2005 and provides:

(a) A peace officer to whom an alleged violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code, is reported shall make a written report to the law enforcement agency that employs the peace officer that includes the following information:

- (1) the name of the victim;
- (2) the name of the suspect, if known;
- (3) the type of identifying information obtained, possessed, transferred, or used in violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code; and
- (4) the results of any investigation.

(b) On the victim's request, the law enforcement agency shall provide the report created under Subsection (a) to the victim. In providing the report, the law enforcement agency shall redact any otherwise confidential information that is included in the report, other than the information described by Subsection (a).

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. For purposes of article 2.29, an offense is committed on or after September 1, 2005 if no "element of the offense occurs before that date." Act of Jun. 17, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 294, § 1(b), 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 885.

In this instance, the submitted report pertains, in part, to a bank debit card fraud investigation, which constitutes an alleged violation of section 32.51. In this instance, the requestor is the victim of the alleged identity theft listed in the report, and the alleged offense occurred after September 1, 2005. Therefore, the submitted report is subject to article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure and must be released to the requestor, except to the extent that it contains confidential information. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. You claim the submitted report is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, section 552.108 is a discretionary exception that does not make information confidential. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 586 (1991) (governmental body may waive section 552.108). Therefore, the submitted incident report may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, you also raise section 552.130 of the Government Code, and we note sections 552.136 and 552.137 of the Government Code may be applicable to some of the submitted information.<sup>1</sup> As sections 552.130, 552.136, and 552.137 are confidentiality provisions, we will address their applicability to the submitted information.

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

You claim portions of the submitted report are excepted under section 552.130 of the Government Code, which provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). Thus, the department must withhold the Texas driver's license and license plate numbers we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

The remaining information includes a bank account number and credit card numbers that do not belong to the requestor. Section 552.136 of the Government Code states "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." *Id.* § 552.136. We find the bank account number at issue constitutes an access device number for purposes of section 552.136. Thus, the department must withhold the bank account and credit card numbers we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

The remaining information includes e-mail addresses subject to section 552.137 of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body," unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail addresses in the remaining information are not specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). As such, these e-mail addresses, which we have marked, must be withheld under section 552.137, unless the owners of the addresses have affirmatively consented to their release. *See id.* § 552.137(b).

In summary, the department must withhold the marked Texas driver's license and license plate numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code; bank account and credit card numbers under section 552.136 of the Government Code; and e-mail addresses under 552.137 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to this requestor.<sup>2</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free,

---

<sup>2</sup>If the department receives another request for this information from an individual other than this requestor, the department should again seek our decision.

at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Leah B. Wingerson". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Leah B. Wingerson  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

LBW/dls

Ref: ID# 363205

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)