



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 17, 2009

Mr. Christopher A. Troutt
Walsh, Anderson, Brown, Aldridge & Gallegos, P.C.
For Alvarado ISD
P.O. Box 168046
Irving, Texas 75016

OR2009-17879

Dear Mr. Troutt:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 364813.

The Alvarado Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for specified e-mail communications made on a particular date and any e-mail communications pertaining to two named individuals and occurring over a specified period of time.¹ You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.107 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information. We have also considered comments submitted by the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (providing that an interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

We must address the requestor's assertion that the district did not meet its procedural obligations under the Act. Section 552.301 of the Government Code describes the procedural obligations placed on a governmental body that receives a written request for information it wishes to withhold. Pursuant to section 552.301(b) of the Government Code,

¹You state the district sought and received clarification from the requestor regarding the request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222(b) (stating if information requested is unclear to governmental body or if large amount of information has been requested, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify or narrow request, but may not inquire into purpose for which information will be used).

the governmental body must request a ruling from this office and state the exceptions to disclosure that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See id.* § 552.301(b). Pursuant to section 552.301(e) of the Government Code, the governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving the request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *See id.* § 552.301(e).

In this instance, you state the district received the written request for information on September 15, 2009 and sought clarification of the request on September 24, 2009. *See id.* § 552.222. Thus, the ten-business-day time period to request a decision from this office under section 552.301(b) was tolled on the date the district sought clarification of the request from the requestor. *See* Open Records Decision No. 663 at 5 (1999) (clarification does not trigger new ten-business-day time interval, but merely tolls ten-business-day deadline during clarification or narrowing process, which resumes upon receipt of clarified or narrowed response). The district received the requestor's clarification on September 25, 2009. Thus, the district's ten-business-day deadline was September 30, 2009. However, you did not request a ruling from this office or submit a copy or representative sample of the information requested until October 9, 2009. Thus, we find the district failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the information is public and must be released. Information presumed public must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *See id.* § 552.302; *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 279 S.W.3d 806, 811 (Tex. App.—Amarillo 2007, pet. granted); *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Normally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). By failing to comply with the procedural requirements of the Act, the district waived its claim under section 552.107 of the Government Code, which is a discretionary exception to disclosure. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 676 at 11-12 (2002) (attorney-client privilege under section 552.107 and Texas Rule of Evidence 503 subject to waiver), 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (untimely request for a decision resulted in waiver of discretionary exceptions), 630 at 4-5 (1994) (governmental body may waive statutory predecessor to section 552.107). Accordingly, the district may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.107

of the Government Code. As you raise no further exceptions to disclosure of the submitted information, it must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Matt Entsminger
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MRE/dls

Ref: ID# 364813

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)