



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 8, 2010

Mr. U.H. Specht
Legal Advisor
Carrollton Police Department
2025 East Jackson Road
Carrollton, Texas 75006-1739

OR2010-01852

Dear Mr. Specht:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 369610.

The City of Carrollton (the "city") received a request for the audio recordings of all emergency 9-1-1 calls and non-emergency calls made by and/or to city police department dispatchers and all city police department two-way radio communications for a specified time period and computer aided dispatch ("CAD") reports, offense reports and all records placed into evidence related to a specified event. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.108(a) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state, and provide documentation showing, that the requested information relates to criminal cases that have been filed with the Denton County District Attorney's Office and are currently pending prosecution. Based upon this representation, we conclude section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases).

Section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to basic front-page information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-66. Thus, the city must release basic information, including a detailed description of the offense, even if the information does not literally appear on the front page of an offense or arrest report. *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). We note the submitted information contains CAD reports. In Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996), this office concluded that information contained in a CAD report is substantially the same as basic information and, thus, is not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.108. *See* ORD 649 at 3; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 394 at 3 (1983) (there is no qualitative difference between information contained in radio cards or radio logs and front page offense report information expressly held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*, and, thus, such information is generally public). Therefore, with the exception of the basic information, the city may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. However, you assert that portions of the basic information are subject to common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Common-law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Industrial Found. v. Texas Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *See* 540 S.W.2d at 683. Upon review, however, we find that no portion of the basic information is highly intimate or embarrassing information of no legitimate public interest. Thus, none of the basic information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, the city may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kate Hartfield
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KH/dls

Ref: ID# 369610

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)