



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

February 9, 2010

Mr. Robert Massey
Assistant City Attorney II
City of Wichita Falls
P.O. Box 1431
Wichita Falls, Texas 76307

OR2010-01957

Dear Mr. Robert Massey:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 370001 (City ID# 311).

The Wichita Falls Police Department (the "department") received a request for all reports involving a named individual. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouses files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has

significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. You argue that the present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the individual at issue. However, upon review, we find that none of the submitted information lists this individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. We therefore conclude that none of the submitted information may be withheld as a compilation of criminal history.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which you assert for a portion of the submitted information. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code. We note that section 58.007 is inapplicable in this instance because the juvenile conduct at issue occurred in 1993. However, section 51.14 of the Family Code is applicable to this information. Prior to its repeal by the Seventy-fourth Legislature, section 51.14(d) of the Family Code provided for the confidentiality of juvenile law enforcement records. Law enforcement records pertaining to conduct occurring before January 1, 1996, are governed by the former section 51.14(d), which was continued in effect for that purpose. *See* Act of May 27, 1995, 74th Leg., R.S., ch. 262, § 100, 1995 Tex. Gen. Laws 2517, 2591. Section 51.14 applies to records of a "child," which is defined as a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2). Former section 51.14 provided in relevant part as follows:

(d) Except as provided by Article 15.27, Code of Criminal Procedure, and except for files and records relating to a charge for which a child is transferred under Section 54.02 of this code to a criminal court for prosecution, the law-enforcement files and records are not open to public inspection nor may their contents be disclosed to the public, but inspection of the files and records is permitted by:

- (1) a juvenile court having the child before it in any proceeding;
- (2) an attorney for a party to the proceeding; and
- (3) law-enforcement officers when necessary for the discharge of their official duties.

Fam. Code § 51.14 (repealed 1995). Report no. 93-120076 concerns juvenile delinquent conduct that occurred prior to January 1, 1996. Therefore, this report is confidential under former section 51.14(d) of the Family Code and must be withheld in its entirety pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(2) excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime ... if ... it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body must reasonably explain how and why section 552.108 is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You inform us, and have provided a letter from the department’s chief of police stating that two of the remaining reports are related to concluded police investigations that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. Thus, having considered your representations and the police chief’s letter, we find that you have demonstrated that report nos. 00-071001 and 94-031606 fall within the scope of section 552.108(a)(2).

We note, however, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic front-page information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976), including a detailed description of the offense. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold report nos. 00-071001 and 94-031606 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. However, common-law privacy excepts from public disclosure portions of the basic information.

The types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. 540 S.W.2d at 683. This office has found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (information pertaining to illness from severe emotional and job-related stress protected by common-law privacy), 455 (1987) (information pertaining to prescription drugs, specific illnesses, operations and procedures, and physical disabilities protected from disclosure).

Upon review, we find that portions of the basic information in report no. 94-031606 and the information in report no. 92-06-2714, which we have marked, are highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Accordingly, the department must withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note the remaining information contains Texas motor vehicle record information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code, which provides that information relating to a

motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release.¹ Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). The department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.²

In summary, the department must withhold report no. 93-120076 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former section 51.14(d) of the Family Code. Except for basic information, the department may withhold report nos. 00-071001 and 94-031606 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Mack T. Harrison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MTH/rl

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

² We note this office recently issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including a Texas driver's license number and a Texas license plate number under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

Ref: ID# 370001

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)