



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 11, 2010

Ms. Candice De La Garza
Assistant City Attorney
City of Houston
P.O. Box 368
Houston, Texas 77001-0368

OR2010-02117

Dear Ms. De La Garza:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 370152.

The City of Houston (the "city") received a request for all records pertaining to emergency medical services ("EMS") on a specified date involving four named EMS personnel as well as the complaint history, training history, certifications received, and instructor's comments for the four personnel during a specified time frame. You state you will release some information to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information that other statutes make confidential, including section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code. Section 773.091 provides in relevant part:

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or

maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

...

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services.

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(b), (g). You state the information in Exhibit 2 was created by EMS personnel. Based on your representation and our review, we conclude the information in Exhibit 2 constitutes EMS records that are confidential under section 773.091. We note, however, records that are confidential under section 773.091 may be disclosed to “any person who bears a written consent of the patient or other persons authorized to act on the patient’s behalf for the release of confidential information.” *Id.* §§ 773.092(e)(4), .093. Section 773.093 provides that a consent for release of EMS records must specify: (1) the information or records to be covered by the release; (2) the reasons or purpose for the release; and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *Id.* § 773.093. You do not indicate that the city has received the written consent of either the patients or other authorized persons. Therefore, with the exception of the information subject to section 773.091(g), which is not confidential, the city must withhold the submitted EMS records in Exhibit 2 pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091(b) of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 143.089 of the Local Government Code. You state that the city is a civil service city under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. Section 143.089 provides for the existence of two different types of personnel files relating to a fire fighter: one that must be maintained as part of the fire fighter’s civil service file and another the fire department may maintain for its own internal use. *See* Local Gov’t Code § 143.089(a), (g). The fire fighter’s civil service file must contain certain specified items, including commendations, periodic evaluations by the fire fighter’s supervisor, and documents relating to any misconduct in which the department took disciplinary action against the fire fighter under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. *Id.* § 143.089(a)(1)-(2). Chapter 143 prescribes the following types of disciplinary actions: removal, suspension, demotion, and uncompensated duty. *Id.* §§ 143.051-.055.

In cases in which a fire department investigates a fire fighter’s misconduct and takes disciplinary action against a fire fighter, it is required by section 143.089(a)(2) to place all investigatory records relating to the investigation and disciplinary action, including background documents such as complaints, witness statements, and documents of like nature from individuals who were not in a supervisory capacity, in the fire fighter’s civil service file maintained under section 143.089(a). *See Abbott v. Corpus Christi*, 109 S.W.3d 113, 122

(Tex. App.—Austin 2003, no pet.). All investigatory materials in a case resulting in disciplinary action are “from the employing department” when they are held by or are in the possession of the department because of its investigation into a fire fighter’s misconduct, and the department must forward them to the civil service commission for placement in the civil service personnel file. *Id.* Such records may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.089 of the Local Government Code. *See* Local Gov’t Code § 143.089(f); Open Records Decision No. 562 at 6 (1990).

However, a document relating to a fire fighter’s alleged misconduct may not be placed in his civil service personnel file if there is insufficient evidence to sustain a charge of misconduct. *See* Local Gov’t Code § 143.089(b). In addition, a document relating to disciplinary action against a fire fighter that has been placed in the fire fighter’s personnel file as provided by section 143.089(a)(2) must be removed from the fire fighter’s file if the commission finds that the disciplinary action was taken without just cause or the charge of misconduct was not supported by sufficient evidence. *See* Local Gov’t Code § 143.089(c). Information that reasonably relates to a fire fighter’s employment relationship with the fire department and that is maintained in a fire department’s internal file pursuant to section 143.089(g) is confidential and must not be released. *See City of San Antonio v. San Antonio Express-News*, 47 S.W.3d 556 (Tex. App.—San Antonio 2000, pet. denied); *City of San Antonio v. Tex. Attorney General*, 851 S.W.2d 946, 949 (Tex. App.—Austin 1993, writ denied).

You state that the information in Exhibit 3 is maintained in the city fire department’s internal personnel files for one of the named fire fighters, and we understand that none of this information pertains to an investigation that has resulted in disciplinary action against the fire fighter at issue. Based on your representations and our review of the records at issue, we agree that this information is confidential pursuant to section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code. Therefore, the information in Exhibit 3 must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.¹

In summary, the city must withhold the EMS records in Exhibit 2 under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, with the exception of the information subject to section 773.091(g). The city must withhold the information in Exhibit 3 under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Nneka Kanu', with a stylized flourish at the end.

Nneka Kanu
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NK/jb

Ref: ID# 370152

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)