



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 16, 2010

Mr. Gary A. Scott
Assistant City Attorney
City of Conroe
P.O. Box 3066
Conroe, Texas 77305

OR2010-02266

Dear Mr. Scott:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 374218.

The City of Conroe (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to a named individual. You state that the city has released some of the responsive information to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information that is considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the common-law right of privacy. Common-law privacy protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found that a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. For Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction

between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not private and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

In this instance, the request is for information pertaining to a named individual. Thus, this request requires the city to compile the named individual's criminal history. Therefore, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note that you have submitted information that does not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not implicate the privacy interests of the named individual and may not be withheld based on common-law privacy. However, we will address your remaining arguments against the disclosure of this information.

You claim incident number 05073299 is subject to section 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides in pertinent part as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Law enforcement records relating to juvenile conduct, whether delinquent conduct or conduct in need of supervision, that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code. *See id.*

§ 51.03 (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of title 3 of the Family Code). For purposes of section 58.007, “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find that incident number 05073299 involves an allegation of a juvenile engaged in conduct indicating a need for supervision occurring after September 1, 1997. You do not indicate, nor does it appear, that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 of the Family Code apply to this information. Thus, incident number 05073299 is subject to section 58.007(c), and must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code.¹

Next, you claim that the incident reports in Exhibit B are excepted under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See Gov't Code* § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state that the incident reports in Exhibit B pertain to criminal investigations by the city's police department that have been concluded and that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representations and our review, we find that section 552.108(a)(2) is generally applicable to Exhibit B.

However, as you acknowledge, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, which you state has been released, the city may withhold Exhibit B under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.²

In summary, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold incident number 05073299 in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against the disclosure of portions of this information.

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against the disclosure of portions of these reports.

Family Code. With the exception of basic information, which you state has been released, the city may withhold Exhibit B under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Laura Ream Lemus
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LRL/jb

Ref: ID# 374218

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)