



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

February 18, 2010

Ms. Luz E. Sandoval-Walker  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of El Paso  
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9<sup>th</sup> Floor  
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2010-02451

Dear Ms. Sandoval-Walker:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 370902.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, such as section section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides in pertinent part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the department or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law; and

(3) the identity of the person who made the report.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l). You state that the submitted information relates to an investigation of child abuse by the department. Based upon your representation and our review, we find the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation by the department of alleged or suspected child abuse under chapter 261. *See id.* § 261.001(1) (defining “abuse” for the purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); *see also id.* §101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201 as “person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes”). Accordingly, we find that the submitted information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code.

In this instance, however, the submitted information reveals that the requestor is the mother of the child victim listed in the information at issue. Further, the requestor is not the individual alleged to have committed the suspected abuse. *See id.* § 261.201(k). Because the requestor is a parent of the child victim, the department may not use section 261.201(a)

to withhold the submitted information from this requestor. *Id.* Section 261.201(1)(3), however, states the identity of the reporting party must be withheld. *Id.* § 261.201(1)(3). Thus, the department must withhold the reporting party's identity under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(1)(3) of the Family Code. In addition, section 261.201(1)(2) states that any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law may still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(1)(2). Thus, because you also assert section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law and constitutional privacy for the submitted information, we will address your remaining arguments.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the common-law and constitutional rights of privacy. Common-law privacy protects information that: (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). This office has found the identities of juvenile victims of abuse or neglect are excepted from public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See Open Records Decision No. 394* (1983); *cf. Fam. Code* § 261.201. This office has also found that some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are confidential under common-law privacy. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 470* (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Upon review, we agree that some of submitted information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. However, the requestor is the parent of the individual whose privacy interests are at issue in this instance. Accordingly, the requestor has a special right of access to the information that would generally be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy, and it may not be withheld from her on that basis. *See Gov't Code* § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's representative on grounds that information is considered confidential by privacy principles).

Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. *See Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S. 589, 599-600 (1977); *Open Records Decision Nos. 600* at 3-5 (1992), 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7 (1987). The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy" which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *ORD* 455 at 4. The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* at 7. The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common-law doctrine of privacy; constitutional privacy under section 552.101 is reserved for "the most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (quoting *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Tex.*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). Upon review, we find the department has not demonstrated how any of the submitted information falls within the zones of privacy or

implicates an individual's privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.101 on the basis of constitutional privacy.

In summary, the department must withhold the reporting party's identity under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(1)(3) of the Family Code. As no further exceptions are raised, the remaining information must be released to this requestor.<sup>1</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Laura Ream Lemus  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

LRL/jb

Ref: ID# 370902

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>1</sup>We note that the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released. Because such information is confidential with respect to the general public, if the department receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office.