



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

February 19, 2010

Mr. Marc Allen Connelly  
Deputy General Counsel  
Texas Department of State Health Services  
P.O. Box 149347  
Austin, Texas 78714

OR2010-02513

Dear Mr. Connelly:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 370714.

The Department of State Health Services (the "department") received a request for the reports pertaining to two specified complaints, as well as any reports pertaining to complaints or investigations related to a specified end stage renal disease facility from 2006-2007. You state the department will release some information to the requestor, including the reports pertaining to the two specified complaints. You claim the marked information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, you acknowledge, and we agree, the department failed to request a ruling or submit the responsive information within the statutory time periods prescribed by sections 552.301(b) and 552.301(e) of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b), (e). Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released, unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 279 S.W.3d 806, 811 (Tex. App.—Amarillo 2007, pet. granted); *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ)

(governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). A compelling reason exists when third-party interests are at stake or when information is confidential by law. Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977). Because section 552.101 can provide a compelling reason to withhold information, we will consider whether or not the submitted information is excepted under the Act.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 552.101 encompasses Chapter 251 of the Health and Safety Code, which relates to end stage renal disease facilities. Section 251.015 provides as follows:

(a) A medical review board shall advise the department on minimum standards and rules to be adopted under this chapter.

(b) The medical review board shall review the information on quality of care provided in the annual report filed under Section 251.013(f) and other appropriate information provided to or compiled by the department with respect to an end stage renal disease facility. Based on the review, the medical review board may advise the department about the quality of care provided by a facility and recommend an appropriate corrective action plan under Section 251.061 or other enforcement proceedings against the facility.

(c) Information concerning the quality of care provided to or compiled by the department or medical review board and a recommendation of the medical review board are confidential. The information or recommendation may not be made available for public inspection, is not subject to disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, and is not subject to discovery, subpoena, or other compulsory legal process.

(d) The department, in its discretion, may release to a facility information relating to that facility that is made confidential under Subsection (c). Release of information to a facility under this subsection does not waive the confidentiality of that information or the privilege from compulsory legal process.

Health & Safety Code § 251.015. Section 251.061 of the Health and Safety Code provides in part:

(g) A corrective action plan is not confidential. Information contained in the plan may be excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, in accordance with that chapter or other applicable law.

*Id.* § 251.061(g). You have marked information you assert is confidential pursuant to section 251.015(c) of the Health and Safety Code. You represent that this information consists of quality of care information compiled by the department or the medical review board or constitutes recommendations of the medical review board. Although you acknowledge that generally, corrective action plans are not confidential pursuant to section 251.061(g), you assert the corrective action plans you have highlighted are confidential under other law. Specifically, you explain that the corrective action plans you have marked also constitute confidential quality of care information subject to section 251.015(c). Based on your representations and our review of the information at issue, we agree that the information you have highlighted is confidential under section 251.015(c) of the Health and Safety Code. Therefore, this information must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. As you raise no further exceptions to disclosure, the remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Bob Davis  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

RSD/cc

Ref: ID# 370714

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)