



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

February 22, 2010

Mr. Ronald D. Stutes
Potter Minton
For City of Palestine
P.O. Box 359
Tyler, Texas 75710

OR2010-02560

Dear Mr. Stutes:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 375203.

The City of Palestine (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for information related to a specified incident. You state that some responsive information has been provided to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that section 552.022 of the Government Code is applicable to some of the submitted information. Section 552.022(a)(17) provides for required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record," unless the information is expressly confidential under other law. Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). We have marked court documents that are subject to section 552.022(a)(17). Although you seek to withhold the court documents under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code, those sections are discretionary exceptions to disclosure that protect a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See id.* § 552.007; *Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive Gov't Code § 552.103); Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.108 subject to waiver). As such, sections 552.103 and 552.108 are not other law that makes information expressly confidential for the purposes of section 552.022(a)(17).

Therefore, the marked court documents may not be withheld under section 552.103 or section 552.108 and must be released.

You claim that the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime if release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the requested information relates to a pending criminal investigation, and release of the information would interfere with the investigation of the pending criminal case. Generally, the release of information pertaining to an open case is presumed to interfere with the criminal investigation. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). We note, however, the information at issue includes a Statutory Warning and a Notice of Suspension. Review of the submitted information indicates the Statutory Warning and Notice of Suspension, which we have marked, have previously been provided to the arrestee. Because copies of these documents have previously been released to the arrestee, we find you have not shown how release of these documents will interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Accordingly, the Statutory Warning and Notice of Suspension may not be withheld under section 552.108(a)(1). Because the remaining information at issue has not been previously released, we conclude release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. Thus, we find section 552.108(a)(1) is generally applicable to the remaining information at issue.

We also note, and you acknowledge, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” *Id.* § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic front-page information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). We note that basic information described in *Houston Chronicle* does not include Texas motor vehicle record information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release basic information, even if the information does not literally appear on the front page of an offense or arrest report. Therefore, with the exception of the Statutory Warning, Notice of Suspension, and basic information, the remaining submitted information may be withheld under section 552.108(a)(1).¹

¹As our ruling is dispositive for the information subject to section 552.108(a)(1), we do not address your remaining arguments for this information, except to note basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle* is generally not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991).

You also claim the Statutory Warning and the Notice of Suspension are excepted under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Section 552.103 provides in relevant part as follows:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). The purpose of section 552.103 is to protect the litigation interests of governmental bodies that are parties to the litigation at issue. *See id.* § 552.103(a); Open Records Decision No. 638 at 2 (1996) (section 552.103 only protects the litigation interests of the governmental body claiming the exception). A governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show section 552.103(a) is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation was pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, no pet.); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). A governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a).

You inform us the submitted information relates to a criminal case and the Anderson County District Attorney's Office will prosecute this crime. We note, however, the purpose of section 552.103 is to enable a governmental body to protect its position in litigation by forcing parties to obtain information that is related to litigation through discovery procedures. *See* ORD 551 at 4-5. Thus, information that has either been obtained from or provided to the opposing party in the litigation is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a), and it must be disclosed. The submitted Statutory Warning and Notice of Suspension were provided to the individual who was cited; thus, the Statutory Warning and Notice of Suspension were inevitably seen by the opposing party to the litigation. Therefore, the submitted Statutory Warning and Notice of Suspension may not be withheld under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

You argue portions of the Statutory Warning and Notice of Suspension are excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 provides in relevant part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirement of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

(1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]

(2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). Thus, the city must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked in the Statutory Warning and Notice of Suspension under section 552.130 of the Government Code.²

Therefore, (1) the marked court documents must be released pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code; (2) with the exception of basic information, the Statutory Warning, and the Notice of Suspension, the city may withhold the remaining submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code; and (3) the city must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked in the Statutory Warning and Notice of Suspension under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public

²We note that this office recently issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies, which authorizes withholding of ten categories of information, including Texas driver's license numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

³We note the basic information includes the arrestee's social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147.

information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Cindy Nettles". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name being more prominent.

Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 375203

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)