



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

February 24, 2010

Ms. Griselda Sanchez
Assistant City Attorney
City of San Antonio
9800 Airport Boulevard
San Antonio, Texas 78216

OR2010-02783

Dear Ms. Sanchez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 374426 (COSA File Nos. 10-0048 and 10-0128).

The City of San Antonio (the "city") received two requests for the following information pertaining to explosive detection canines in service at the San Antonio International Airport: (1) certification test results, including the "latest" results; (2) general standards of performance; (3) how many explosive detection canines are currently in service; and (4) how many of those canines have failed or passed the certification tests since 2002. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.¹

Initially, we note the city asserts it does not have information responsive to the request for the "latest" test results and the general standards for explosive detection canines. The city states it anticipates receiving the "latest" test results "in the near future" and requests this office rule as to whether such records would be subject to disclosure. We note the Act does not require a governmental body to disclose information that did not exist at the time the request was received, nor does it require a governmental body to prepare new information in response to a request. *Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ *dism'd*); Attorney General Opinion H-90 (1973); Open Records Decision Nos. 452 at 2-3 (1986), 342 at 3 (1982), 87 (1975); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 572 at 1(1990), 555 at 1-2 (1990), 416 at 5 (1984). Because the “latest” test results did not exist at the time the first request was received, this information is not responsive to the first request, and this ruling will not address such information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information that other statutes make confidential, including federal law. *See English v. Gen. Elec. Co.*, 496 U.S. 72, 79 (1990). Effective November 19, 2001, Congress enacted the Aviation and Transportation Security Act (“ATSA”), which created the United States Transportation Security Administration (the “TSA”), a new agency within the United States Department of Transportation (“DOT”) headed by the Under Secretary of Transportation for Security (the “Under Secretary”). *See* 49 U.S.C. § 114(a), (b)(1). The ATSA provides that, by November 19, 2002, the responsibility for inspecting persons and property carried by aircraft operators and foreign air carriers will be transferred from the Federal Aviation Administration (the “FAA”) Administrator to the Under Secretary as head of the TSA. These responsibilities include carrying out the requirements of chapter 449 of title 49 of the United States Code, which pertain to civil aviation security. *See id.* § 114(d)(1). Section 40119 of title 49, a provision that formerly applied to the FAA Administrator, now states:

Notwithstanding [the Federal Freedom of Information Act (the “FOIA”)] and the establishment of a Department of Homeland Security [(“DHS”)], the [Under Secretary] shall prescribe regulations prohibiting disclosure of information obtained or developed in ensuring security under this title if the [Under Secretary] decides disclosing the information would

- (A) be an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy;
- (B) reveal a trade secret or privileged or confidential commercial or financial information; or
- (C) be detrimental to transportation safety.

Id. § 40119(b)(1). The language of this provision authorizes the TSA’s Under Secretary to prescribe regulations “prohibiting disclosure of information obtained or developed in ensuring security.” It authorizes the Under Secretary to prescribe regulations that prohibit disclosure of information requested not only under the FOIA, but also under other disclosure statutes. *Cf. Pub. Citizen, Inc. v. Fed. Aviation Admin.*, 988 F.2d 186, 194 (D.C. Cir. 1993) (former section 40119 authorized FAA Administrator to prescribe regulations prohibiting disclosure of information under other statutes as well as under FOIA). Thus, the Under Secretary is authorized by section 40119(b)(1) to prescribe regulations that prohibit disclosure of information requested under the Act.

Pursuant to the mandate and authority of section 40119, the DOT's FAA and the TSA jointly published new regulations pertaining to civil aviation security, which are found in title 49 of the Code of Federal Regulations and which took effect February 17, 2002. *See* 67 Fed. Reg. 8340. Section 1520.1(a) of these regulations explains that the regulations govern the "maintenance, safeguarding, and disclosure of records and information that TSA has determined to be Sensitive Security Information ["SSI"], as defined in § 1520.5." 49 C.F.R. § 1520.1(a). Section 1520.7 states that the covered persons to which these regulations apply to include, among others, airport operators, such as the city, and "[e]ach person employed by, contracted to, or acting for a covered person[.]" *See id.* § 1520.7(a), (k). Further, section 1520.7(j) specifies that these regulations apply to "[e]ach person who has access to SSI, as specified in [section] 1520.11." *Id.* § 1520.7(j). Pursuant to section 1520.11(a), a person has a need to know SSI "[w]hen the person requires access to specific SSI to carry out transportation security activities approved, accepted, funded, recommended, or directed by DHS or DOT." *See id.* § 1520.11(a). Section 1520.11(b) further states that a local government employee has a need to know SSI if access to the information is necessary for performance of the employee's official duties on behalf or in defense of the interests of the local government. *See id.* § 1520.11(b)(1). Thus, the regulations in title 49 of the Code of Federal Regulations apply to the city.

As to the release of information by persons other than the TSA, section 1520.9(a) of title 49 provides in part that a person to which these regulations apply has a duty to protect information, and may disclose SSI "only to covered persons who have a need to know, unless otherwise authorized in writing by the TSA, the Coast Guard, or the Secretary of DOT." *Id.* § 1520.9(a). Section 1520.9(a)(3) of title 49 further provides that those covered by the regulation must "[r]efer requests by other persons for SSI to the TSA or the applicable component or agency within DOT or DHS." *Id.* § 1520.9(a)(3). SSI is defined to include certain information obtained or developed in the conduct of security activities, the disclosure of which the TSA has determined would constitute an unwarranted invasion of privacy, reveal trade secrets or privileged or confidential information obtained from any person, or be detrimental to the security of transportation. *Id.* § 1520.5(a). SSI includes, but is not limited to, "any performance specification and any description of a test object or test procedure for . . . [a]ny device used by the Federal Government or any other person pursuant to any aviation or maritime transportation security requirements of Federal law for the detection of any person, and any weapon, explosive, incendiary, or destructive device, item, or substance[.]" "[a]ny security screener test and scores of such tests[.]" as well as "[p]erformance or testing data from security equipment or screening systems." *See id.* §§ 1520.5(b)(4)(i), .5(b)(9)(iv), .5(b)(9)(v).

You state, and submit documentation showing, that the city forwarded these requests for information to the TSA. The TSA responded and stated that the responsive information constitutes SSI that may not be publicly disclosed. Based on the statutory and regulatory scheme described above, we agree that the decision to release or withhold the information in question is not for this office or the city to make, but rather is a decision for the Under Secretary as head of the TSA. *See English*, 496 U.S. at 79 (state law is preempted to extent

it actually conflicts with federal law). Therefore, the city may not release any of the submitted information at this time under the Act.

The city asks this office to issue a previous determination permitting the city to withhold information that constitutes SSI under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1520.9(a) of title 49 of the Code of Federal Regulations without requesting a ruling from this office. You have demonstrated that you understand that it is the city's responsibility to forward aviation security information directly to the TSA, as this office is not permitted to review such information. Accordingly, as this office is not permitted to review aviation security information, we cannot issue a previous determination regarding such information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jennifer Luttrall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JL/dls

Ref: ID# 374426

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)