



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 23, 2010

Ms. Luz E. Sandoval- Walker
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9th Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2010-04070

Dear Ms. Sandoval- Walker:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 374356.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received two requests from the same requestor for complaint reports, 9-1-1 transcripts, and all other information pertaining to two named individuals. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note some of the submitted information is not responsive to the instant request as it does not pertain to either of the named individuals. We have marked the non-responsive information. This ruling does not address the public availability of any information that is not responsive to the request and the department is not required to release that information in response to the request.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly

satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. The present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the individuals at issue. We find that this request for unspecified law enforcement records implicates the named individuals' right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note the department has submitted records to this office that do not depict either of the specified individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. Because this information is not part of a compilation of an individual's criminal history, we will address your arguments against release of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). You state report numbers 06-125330, 07- 001197, 07-079107, and 07-030338 were used or developed in an investigation by the department of alleged child abuse. *See id.* § 261.001(1) (defining "abuse" for purposes of Fam. Code ch. 261); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). Based on your representation and our review, we find report numbers 06-125330, 07- 001197, 07-079107, and 07-030338 are within the scope of

section 261.201 of the Family Code. You have not indicated the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information; therefore, we assume that no such rule exists. Given that assumption, the department must withhold these reports, which we have marked, in their entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.¹ See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting either of the specified individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must also withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Lauren J. Holmsley
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LJH/jb

Ref: ID# 374356

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure.